Ministry of Education and Higher Education Educational Development Project

National Educational Strategy in Lebanon

Vision Document

Prepared by

Lebanese Association for Educational Studies

Final Version

15/03/2007

The Basic Foundations for the Strategic Orientations of Education in Lebanon

The National Education Strategy in Lebanon is based on the fundamental principles cherished in the Lebanese Constitution and the National Accord Convention as well as on the laws and regulations governing educational matters which emphasize freedom of and right to education and ensuring the accessibility and equality in opportunities and requirements of education to all. Those principles have also been emphasized in international convention that Lebanon abides by; the most of these are: Declaration of Human rights; the International Convention of economic, social, and cultural rights; and the International Agreement on the Rights of the Child.

This strategy derives its orientation from the agreed-upon fundamental educational principles, especially the humanistic approaches to education that Arab and International educational conventions build on to direct the child towards the comprehensive development of the individual; the reinforcement of respect for human beings and their basic freedom; the development of the ability to actively participate in a free society; the development of a sense of responsibility in a spirit of understanding, peace, and friendship; and the commitment of wide social partnership among those concerned with education in order to ensure meeting the human need for education and for building a knowledge society.

The strategy derives its basic foundation from the educational realities in Lebanon with its particular traditions, especially the closer partnership between public and private sectors in the provision of educational services and in the unique place of Lebanon in the Arab world and internationally which resides in Lebanon's human capital and in its creative and technical power. It also resides in Lebanon's efforts to reform public and higher education, developing and strengthening vocational and technical education to meet the country's development and construction needs, and revising and developing curricula to reinforce national identity and integration as well as spiritual and cultural openness.

Minister of Education and Higher Education Khalid Kabbani

PART I: VISION AND MISSION

I. The Vision

The Vision: Education in Lebanon available on the basis of equal opportunity; education that has good quality and contributes to building an information society, to social integration, and to economic development.

Education Available on the Basis of Equal Opportunity

- 1. Education available to children aged 3-5; public education accessible to this age group.
- 2. Compulsory Basic Education until the age of 15; the state should give access to public education for all, including learners with special needs, and provide equal opportunities for enrollment, for educational continuation and for success.
- 3. Secondary Education (general and technical) available equally: in enrollment, educational continuation, and success and in which students would be given the chance to choose among academic and technical education specializations on the basis of career guidance and educational counseling in order to help them realize their educational and career choices.
- 4. Higher Education (including technical education) available equally and organized in a manner that allows for academic mobility among its various sectors and institutions, provides support for students, and adapts to new trends and student needs.

Quality Education that Contributes to Building a Knowledge Society

- 5. Basic and Secondary Education characterized by the high quality of its curricula, institutions, and outcomes; an education that is aligned with national and international standards.
- 6. Higher education characterized by the high quality of its curricula, institutions, and outcomes; an education that is aligned with national and international standards.
- 7. Education oriented towards the development of knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for handling information and the intensive use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT).

8. Education that develops the general education of individuals and provides them with lifelong learning skills, especially critical thinking skills and moral reasoning¹.

Education that Contributes to Social Integration

- 9. Education that develops citizenship in its three dimensions: National identity, civic participation, and human partnership.
- 10. Education that contributes to social cohesion and provides learners with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for living together in a diverse society.
- 11. Education that contributes to social mobility: horizontally, among geographical

locations and vertically, among social strata.

12. Education that contributes to the social inclusion of dropouts and individuals marginalized inside the school as well as to the prevention of social marginalization.

Education that Contributes to Economic Development

- 13. Education that contributes to the development of human capital.
- 14. Education that provides qualitatively and quantitatively competent work force to meet the needs of the Lebanese labor market, and that can compete in free job markets.

Educational Governance:

- 15. Developing a systematic management strategy for enhancing sector effectiveness.
- 16. Building a wise and dynamic management system for human and financial recourses.
- 17. Building a Financial management system to quality improvement adopting the principle of "expenditure management".

II. The Mission

- A. The Ministry of Education and Higher Education aims, in carrying out its mandate, to achieve its mission which is based on the following principles.
 - a. Taking a leading role in producing a national educational curriculum which would serve as the reference framework for all its policies, its organizational structures, and its programs, projects, and activities.
 - b. Taking a leading role in transforming the Lebanese society into and information society and in preparing scientists, experts, and qualified staff in all domain of life.
 - c. Taking a pivotal role in achieving social progress and economic development.
 - d. Shouldering the responsibility of preparing a thinking, productive citizen and
 - educating him in national belongingness and social integration in a society where justice, freedom, democracy, and peace prevail.
- B. The Ministry of Education and Higher Learning, in order to achieve its mission, takes charge of the following tasks:
 - a. Looking after the public interest in both the public and the private educational sector.
 - b. Managing public education and securing its financial and human needs in a way that ensures the availability and equality of educational opportunities as well as the quality of education.
 - c. Educational planning and sponsoring of educational studies and professional development programs that aim to achieve the Ministry's mission in all its national, human, scientific, and economic dimensions.

Part I: Education Available on the Basis of Equal Opportunity

- 1. Education available to children aged 3-5; public education accessible to this age group.
- 1. The net enrollment rate in preschools for children aged 3-5 reached 77.7%² for the academic year 2004-2005. Although the rate reaches 79.6% for children 5 years of age, it goes down to 72.2% for children 4 years of age and to a meager 26.6% for children 3 years of age. The absence of a clear official commitment to incorporate three-year old children in the educational ladder and the consequent absence of a nursery class from most public preschools are the major reasons behind this low percentage of school enrollment among three-year-old children.
- 2. The non-free private educational sector attracts the highest percentage of the total number of students (61.9%), compared to only 22.7% in the public sector, and 15.4% in the subsidized private sector³. This disproportion among the various educational sectors is highlighted in the case of the schooling of three-year-old children where 82% of them are enrolled in the non-free private sector, and only 5% are enrolled in the public sector despite the fact that the average number of students in a class in public schools is 14 students, which means that certain schools are able to take in additional students.
- 3. The highest enrollment rates in private schools are in the area of Beirut and Mount Lebanon (69-81% approximately), residents of other regions head mostly towards the public and the free private preschools (42-56% approximately).
- 4. With respect to gender, the proportion of males to females is similar among 3, 4, and 5- year-old children in preschools, and this applies to all sectors (non-free private, public, and subsidized private).
- 5. Despite initiatives taken by some private schools to accommodate children with special needs, most private and public schools still do not possess the basic requirements needed for educating these children.
- 1/1/1 ➤ A large percentage of children aged 3-5 remain outside kindergartens, especially those aged 3 and those with special needs. Public education does not provide enough opportunities for children to join kindergartens that meet minimum quality requirements especially in areas outside Beirut and Mount Lebanon.

2. Compulsory Basic Education until the age of 15; the state should give access to public education for all, including learners with special needs, and should provide equal opportunity for enrollment, educational continuation and success.

A. Enrollment

- 6. Enrollment in schools stands at near-saturation in elementary education, where the average net enrollment rate reached 97% during the academic year of 2004-2005⁴. However, the average net enrollment rate dwindles to a meager 68.5 % in intermediate education (excluding few in the CAP and CP certificates⁶). This indicates that, by the end of the elementary cycle, a huge number of students drop out or lag behind in their studies.
- 7. Basic education in Lebanon extends to grade 9 which corresponds to age 15. However, compulsory education, according to Law No. 686 (16/3/1998), stops at age 12. Moreover, this law is yet to be applied in a firm manner.
- 8. The private sector remains the main provider for basic education in Lebanon. Thus, the total number of students in basic education for the year 2004-2005 was 650,666, among whom 37% were enrolled in public schools, 14% in subsidized private schools, and 49% in non-free private schools.
- 9. Differences among sexes are slight and tend to favor of females. There is a 4% difference in the average net enrollment rate for elementary school (95% males vs. 99% females) and a 9% difference at the intermediate level (55% vs. 64%). As for enrollment in schools, and regardless of age, females constitute 48% of elementary education students and 52.2% of intermediate education students. This means that the phenomena of lagging behind in school and dropping out by the end of elementary school applies to males more than to females. In addition, the percentage of females in public schools (52%) is larger than that in private schools (48%); the percentage of females reaches its peak (58%) in grade 9 in public schools.
- 1/2/1 ➤ Enrollment in elementary education in Lebanon stands at near-saturation level (97%). But this percentage drops in intermediate education to 68.5 %. The rate of enrollment in public basic education is rather low (37%).

B. Educational Continuation

- 10. In the past decades, Lebanon witnessed a great improvement in opportunities for educational continuation. Out of a cohort group of 1000 students who enroll in grade 1 of elementary school, 593 drop out of school before grade 12 according to the estimated percentages of 1997-1998 compared to 810 dropouts in 1972-1973. The rate of dropping out at the end of the elementary cycle has remarkably dropped from 21.3% to 3.3% in those two academic years respectively⁸.
- 11. Opportunities for educational continuation still face a number of challenges. The first such challenge is the dropout rate, which takes place beginning in grade 1, and ranges between 0.5% to 3.4% during elementary school; this rate increases to around

- 4-5% in intermediate school and reaches 27% in grade 9 (Brevet). The second challenge is repetition of classes which reached a percentage of 10% in elementary schools for 2004-2005, going as high as 17.9% in grade 4. The rate of class repetition is 13.5% in intermediate school, reaching as high as 20.3% in grade 7°. The third challenge facing educational continuation concerns class retardation (students aged more than their class age); their rate reaches 24.2% in elementary school and 41% in intermediate school. This situation worsens when moving from one cycle to the other; thus, the rate jumps from 19% in grade 3 to 31% in grade 4, to 35% in grade 6, and reaches 41% in grade 7¹⁰.
- 12. With respect to gender, females are better positioned than males; the percentage of educational continuation for females exceeds that of males¹¹ for all classes. The percentage of females promoted to intermediate school is higher than that of males; and the percentage of female dropouts is much lower than that of males in all of Lebanon.
- 13. With respect to geographical districts, the rate of dropouts and repetition is higher in the North, Bekaa, and South as compared to Beirut and Mount Lebanon¹². 14. Opportunities for educational continuation in the private educational sector are better than opportunities in the public sector. The rate of class retardation reaches 24% in elementary school as an average for both sectors. In the public sector, however, it reaches 41.6% in elementary school. At the intermediate school, the average for both sectors is 41.1%, and it reaches 61.2% for the public sector. In grades 4 and 7, the rate reaches 52% and 61% respectively¹³. Moreover, the percentages of dropouts and repeaters are higher in the public sector¹⁴.
- 1/2/2 ➤ There are serious problems with educational continuation that manifest themselves in the high percentages of dropout and class repetition and retardation; such problems reach their peak in the 4th and 7th grades. There are significant differences between the public and private sectors, in favor of the latter.

C. Opportunities for Success in Official Exams

15. Opportunities for passing the official exams at the end of grade 9 (Brevet) increased in the last few years, especially after the implementation of the new curricula. Opportunities for passing the official exams are higher among females and are in favor of Beirut and Mount Lebanon. As for sector differences, opportunities for passing official exams are in favor of the private sector, with lack of homogeneity within the private sector¹⁵.

1/2/3 ➤ There is inequality in opportunity of success for passing official examinations between private and public educational sectors.

D. Students with special needs

16. The majority of schools are not fit to accommodate students with special needs; the deficiencies relate to availability of necessary facilities, regarding proper equipment, buildings, special teaching aids, and qualified special education educators. It is hoped that the implementation of the law related to the rights of the

handicapped (law#20, dated 29/5/2000), after the issuance of its implementation decrees, and the implementation of the two decrees related to students with special needs (Decree #16417/2006) and to the gifted (Decree #16614/2006) will lead to the securing of facilities, and necessary requirements for making it possible for these people to enjoy their right to education.

- 1/2/4 ➤ The educational system does not provide enough measures that cater to students with special needs (retarded and gifted) through the provision of educational material and human resources needed to develop their diverse abilities and to integrate them with their peers.
 - 3. Secondary Education (general, vocational and technical) available equally: in enrollment, educational continuation, and success. Students would be given the chance to choose among academic and technical education specializations based on objective guidance and educational counseling in order to reinforce their autonomy and to help them improve their educational and career choices.

A. Enrollment

- 17. The percentage of 15-19 year olds enrolled in school is 71%¹⁶. However, a little over half of those enrolled (52.3% of them) are found in secondary education; the rest are distributed between intermediate school (31.3%) and higher education (16.5%). If the analysis were restricted to the 15-17 age group, the typical age of students in secondary school (both general and vocational education), the net enrollment rate would be estimated at around 50%¹⁷, which is considered to be low compared to developed countries.
- 18. There is gender inequality in terms of enrollment in secondary education in favor of girls. The enrollment rate for the 15-19 age group drops from 74% for females to 67% for males, i.e. a difference of 7%.
- 19. The number of students enrolled in secondary education (general and vocational) is 1556,891¹⁸. Of these students, the public school system accommodates 50.1% of secondary education students (53% general education, 46% vocational education).
- 20. The difference between the private and public sectors is caused by the discrepancies that exist among the tracks students join. In general secondary education, private school students have more chances of joining the scientific tracks on account of the fact that private schools are free to choose their students and, consequently, to reject the weak ones. On the other hand, public school students are more likely to enroll in the humanities sociology and economics tracks because these schools have no choice but to accept all students. There is a 15 to 30% difference in the chances of joining the scientific tracks between the public and the private sectors.

1/3/1 ➤ Secondary education is reasonably available with an enrollment covering 50% of the population aged 15-17, but this ratio remains below the enrollment rates in developed countries. Gender inequality in opportunities of enrollment is slight in favor of females.

B. Educational Continuation

21. Class retardation - which could be due to late enrollment, class repetition in previous cycles, or repetition in the secondary cycle - remains the major problem in the secondary cycle or repetition of the third class (Grade 12). The rate of class retardation reaches its peak (42.6%) in grade 12, the last class in the cycle. This rate reaches 34% in the first class (grade 10) and 33 % in the second class (grade 11). 22. The inequality in educational continuity (in the sense of class retardation) between the sexes and between the public and the private is slight, favoring females and the private sector respectively. The rate of class retardation within the public sector reaches 48.7% in the whole cycle and 56.1% in the third secondary. Furthermore, class retardation occurs more often in vocational and technical education than it does in general education.

C. Success in Official Exams

- 23. The rate of passing of official exams is estimated at 70%. While this rate is considered satisfactory, it remains lower than what it is supposed to be.
 24. Discrepancies exist as far as the rate of passing the official examinations is concerned: 1) between the private and the public sectors, in favor of the private sector; 2) among the various academic tracks, where the highest success rate is in the general sciences track followed by that in life sciences, that in sociology and economics, and finally that in the humanities tracks; 3) between sexes, in favor of girls; and 4) between English-educated and French-educated students, in favor of English-educated students in all tracks. The rate of success does not vary by geographical location²⁰.
- 1/3/2 ➤ There is inequality between private and public sectors in terms of opportunity of success in passing the official examinations, which tends to favor the private sector and which is related to discrepancies in achievement and to high class retardation rate in the public sector.

D. The structure of Secondary Education

25. Secondary Education branches into separate tracks as of the second year. Every track or specialty has a set curriculum made up of required courses for all students of the track. Students are tested in all these courses at school, then at the official exams at the end of the third year of secondary school. This system does not offer students the opportunity to choose and denies them the opportunity to engage in independent thinking, and to make the proper educational and career choices since it unifies educational offerings.

1/3/3 The secondary education system remains divided into separate tracks, first, between general and technical education and, second, among the specializations in each. This structure limits educational mobility among tracks and specializations.

E. Development, Structure, and Enrolment Rates in the Vocational and Technical Education Sector.

- 26. In 1996, in an effort to develop the Vocational and Technical Education Sector, the Lebanese government approved a project for building 39 vocational schools and institutes. The total amount of funding for the project by three loans from the Arab Fund, the Islamic Bank, and the OPEC Fund, in addition to the contribution of the Lebanese government, reached the sum total of 102.2 million US\$. A number of these schools were finished during the last 9 years. The purpose of the project for building schools was to increase the capacity of the public education system regarding increasing the number of enrolled students and diversifying specializations. 27. In its efforts to improve the quality of educational and supporting the management of technical and vocational education, the Lebanese government signed an agreement with the World Band in 1999 for a 63 million dollar loan, which was reduced to 29 millions by the end of 2001, and initiated the implementation of its activities. The project faced many obstacles, after it was launched, such as the multiplicity of supervising parties and instability in policies. At the end of 2003, some of the activities falling under the projects were maintained while the remaining activities were added to the World Bank project for public education.
- 28. Vocational and Technical Education at the pre-university level includes: 1) vocational preparation level for those who have finished the 5th grade preparing for the vocational proficiency certificate or the 7th grade preparing for the vocational intermediate certificate; 2) secondary vocational and technical education for those who have finished the 9th grade preparing students for on of two tracks: the first leads to the Technical Baccalaureate and the second to the Technical Secondary Diploma (Double System). The period of study for the secondary is 3 years. At present, these are 34 specialists at the level of the Technical Baccalaureate, 8 at the level of the Technical Secondary Diploma, 19 at the level of the vocational intermediate certificate, and 8 at the level of vocational proficiency.
- 29. The new vocational and technical education structure was issued in 2000 and was based on the new educational framework in Lebanon. One of the main changes in this structure was the cancellation of the certificates and replacing them with training to prepare skilled laborers. However, no decrees were issued to translate the new structure into action and abide by its requirements and the old regulations some of which go back to the sixties remain in effect.
- 30. Enrollment in public vocational and technical education grew rapidly but without a clear methodical plan; it was in response to social need. The number of students in Vocational and Technical Education in 2005-2006 reached 35000 distributed over about 83 public technical schools and institutes. In private Vocational and Technical Education there are about 41500 students in 362 private technical schools and institutes about 55% of the total.
- 31. The pre-university enrollment in Vocational and Technical Education reached 67% of the total number of students in this track. In fact, 81% of public education students are in Technical Baccalaureate (BT) and (TS), while 19% of students are in the other levels, which bring into question the relevance of these levels.

1/3/4 ➤ Regular Vocational and Technical Educating is available in a reasonable fashion, but the enrolment rates remain unequal with general education, especially at the secondary level, and below the rates in developed and recently –industrialized nations. The private sector attracts the majority of students (55%) of those in rolled in regular tracks of vocational and technical education.

F. Study continuation and Success in Vocational and Technical Education

- 32. The problems and issues in vocational education are not much different than those of general secondary education, especially those related to continuation of study and success, where the high rates of repetition, retardation, and dropout are very clear, especially in the first class of the Technical Baccalaureate and in performance on official examinations.
- 33. Vocational and Technical Education has no system or procedures for educational and career guidance and counseling that would help guide students according to their abilities and desires as well as the needs of the job market. The educations system does not have either proper arrangement for those with special needs (handicapped and gifted) in terms of providing educational, material, and human resources and provisions needed for allowing them to develop their different abilities and for integrating them with other students.
- 1/3/5 ➤ there are problems in study continuation and success revealed in the high rates of repetition, retardation, and dropout, especially in the first class of the BT cycle and in performance on official examinations.
- 1/3/6 ➤ The educational system fails to provide adequate arrangements for caring for those with special needs (handicapped and gifted) in terms of providing educational, material, and human resources needed to help them develop their various potentials and integrating them with their peers.

G. Distribution of students and specializations in Vocational and Technical Education

34. The job market study conducted in 2003, funded by the World Bank Project, revealed the existence of imbalance in the distribution of students by specialization and in the skills acquired. It also showed points of weaknesses and strengths of the expansion taking place in technical schools and recommended redistribution of students and specializations to fit the actual needs of the job market.

35. The new public schools were distributed mostly without any basis in educational studies.

36. In the absence of a clear policy based on field studies and accurate clear standards, the decision on specialization in new public Vocational and Technical Education schools was taken randomly (according to subjective top-down decision that were based on the discretion of the administration) without taking into account the actual needs of the job market or the cost. As a result Vocational and Technical Education has been faced by a great imbalance in the distribution of students over specialization; statistics show that 73% of secondary Vocational and Technical Education students are enrolled in five non-industrial and non-medical specializations while the remaining 37 specializations have only 27% of the students. This calls into question the use of maintaining the current structures of vocational preparation (C.A.P., B.P., and S.P.) for two reasons; 1) the low rate of enrollment, coupled with the rise in cost, and 2) the implementation of the principle of mandatory education up the age of 15 and quality improvement. 37. Offering the same specializations in schools that are geographically close has led to the low enrolment in many sections, couple with a great rise in cost per student and the expenditures of large sums of money to provide human resources and equipment needed for the operation of these specializations.

- 1/3/7 ➤ Enrollment in the public Vocational and Technical Education sector has grown considerably, but it did not follow a clear methodical plan, resulting in: 1) imbalance in student distribution by specialization which does not fit the actual needs of the job market; 2) enrolment of 73% of secondary Vocational and Technical Education students in five non-industrial specialization while the remaining 27% are distributed over 37 specializations. It is to be noted that these in overlap between many specializations without basing that on educational research studies or on determining the actual job market needs.
 - 4. Higher Education (including technical education), available equally and organized in a manner that allows for academic mobility among its various sectors and institutions, provides support for students, and adapts to new trends and student needs.

A. Higher Education

38. University education in Lebanon witnessed during the war (1975-1989) the establishment of branches for the L U faculties in all Lebanese regions. Private H.E. also witnessed great expansion in its institutions, faculties and institutes in a short period (1996-2000) whereby the government granted license to 23 new universities and institutes, approved the turning of collages into universities, and approved new faculties, institutes, and departments within existing universities. This expansion was not necessarily tied to actual needs for development in higher education and it did not particularly aim to develop fields of specialization.

- 39. If we estimate that the population of Lebanon was about four million people in 2005, then the average number of students enrolled in higher education (including technical education) would be 4200 per 100,000 habitants. This average is one of the highest in the Arab region. In addition, the average enrollment rate in education for the 20-24 years age group²¹ is 29.7%, with about 1/4 of those enrolled in preuniversity education. However, these two averages (in relation to the general population and to the age group in question) remain below the averages in developed countries (Europe and North America), and in newly-industrialized nations (South Korea for example).
- 40. There is equality between the sexes with respect to enrollment in higher education, in fact, the number of females currently enrolled in higher education has surpassed that of males (54% vs. 46%).
- 1/4/1 ➤ Opportunities to pursue higher education remain less available in Lebanon are reasonable, but remain less than those in developed countries and in recently industrialized nations. There are slight gender differences in the availability of these opportunities, in favor of females.

B. Distribution of Institutions, Students, and Specializations in University Education

- 41. The university education system in Lebanon has one public University, namely, the Lebanese University and 39 private institutions: 18 universities, 13 university institutes, and 4 technological institutes for religions studies. The number of students enrolled at these university institutions was 141479 in 2004-2005.
- 42. The Lebanese University has the highest percentage of students, graduates, and faculty compared to private universities. LU has 49.5% of students to 29% enrolled in 6 private universities. The rest of the private universities and institutes house the remaining 21.5%.
- 43. The four open faculties at LU, those that have no admission test (Arts, law and political and administrative studies, sciences, and social studies), house 74.34% of LU students. The other restricted faculties (Engineering, Medical Sciences, Dentistry, Public Health, Economics and Business Administration, Tourism, University Institute of Technology, and Agriculture) house only 25.66% of students.
- 44. Establishing LU branches aimed at providing public higher education the civil war and to put in place a policy of balanced development. Approximate enrollment figures are as follows: 30% in first branches; 24% in second branches; 17% in the North; 9.5% in Bekaa; 16.8% in the South; and 2.7% in Graduate Studies in the location where deans have their offices.
- 45. Statistics show that chances for enrollment in LU braches outside Beirut and Mount Lebanon is mainly restricted to open faculty specialization which account for 84% of enrolled students in the North, 88% of students in the South, 92% of students in Bekaa (compared to 68% in first branches and 59.5% in second branches, those in Beirut and Mount Lebanon).
- 46. The highest level of enrolment at LU's open faculties is in the first year (44%); it goes down to 20.5% in the second year, which indicates a high rate of failure and repetition of first year. This phenomenon drains the material and human resources of the University and negatively affects the study climate. On the other hand, the low enrollment in the second year and beyond (specialization years) especially in the

4th senior year and in graduate studies (11%), and the overlap in specializations among faculties results in waste of learning resources, both faculty and equipment, and, consequently, to the rise of cost per student in the later years of specializations.

47. The Lebanese University offers 105 theoretical and vocational majors while the private universities offer 160 majors (CERD statistical Bulletin for 2004-2005) distributed over four domains: 1) Science, Engineering, and Information Technology; 2) Medicine and Health; 3) Humanities, Arts, Law and Social Studies; and 4) Economics, Administration, and Services. Statistics show the inflated rate of enrollment in Arts, Humanities, Law, and Social Studies at LU, the majors available at the open faculties (Science is the exception, so we added it to Engineering) and the similarly inflated rates in Economics, Administration, and services in private universities, a major manifestation of imbalance in enrollment within each sector and between sectors.

It is important to note that detailed data show that there is a great difference in the rate of enrolment in medical and health specialization between LU and private universities. LU offers the chance for enrolment for one out of three of students in this domain, which indicates that LU could expand its efforts in this area.

48. It is clear that students' inclination to enroll in one of the specializations offered by the open faculties at LU as well as at private universities is not related to need or to the local and Arab job market trends, but rather to the available opportunities and the financial ability of students. In the private sector, it is noticed that a number of specialization overlap and universities compete to attract students, especially in Business Administration and Information Technology.

1/4/2 ➤ The Lebanese University has the highest rate of enrollment compared to private universities, but there is inequality in enrolment in favor of theoretical specializations in open faculties at LU; there is also a geographical inequality in opportunities for public university education in Applied specializations.

C. Continuation of Study and Success

49. Statistics point to clear discrepancy in the ratio of enrolment and graduation between LU and private universities, which reaches 12.82% at LU compared to 17.68% at the other universities combined. The main reason for this phenomenon at the LU is the inflated number of first year students in open faculties and the low number of those promoted to second year, in addition to other reasons related to the available educational programs, the educational milieu, and the learners themselves.

1/4/3 ➤ There is inequality in study continuation and success between LU and Private Universities and among specialization that manifests itself in the low number of students passing the first year I LU's open faculties compared to the number of those enrolled. Inequality is related to differences in internal effectiveness among the different types of higher education.

D. Counseling Services and Student Support Programs

50. The support that higher education institutions offer to their students takes different forms: 1) offering advising services for students wishing to attend university, such as providing information about entrance examinations; 2) offering financial aid and scholarships, which may reach in very few cases up to 100%; 3) offering intensive courses to support students in basic subjects, such as foreign languages and computer literacy, which are intended to improve the performance level of students in certain fields; 4) assigning an advisor for each group of students to help them make better academic choices; and 5) having a public relations and information office to advise students on the positions available on the job market. We might find all these services or some of them in one university or the other, and we might find other services as well. However, comprehensive support systems are not available at the Lebanese university and at many of the private universities.

1/4/4 ➤ Higher education, except for few exceptions, lacks the ability and the preparedness to offer student support services that could improve students' opportunities of enrollment, help them cover the cost of their education, improve their chances to continue their studies, and improve their choices of courses and fields of study.

E. Academic mobility

51. Academic mobility within higher education in Lebanon is highly limited, and there are plenty of reasons for this lack of academic communication among universities. First, universities in Lebanon are characterized by cultural diversity, where some universities are Francophone while others are either Anglophone or Arabic-speaking universities. Secondly, the universities have different systems (in curricula, examinations, and courses offered as well as in course descriptions); this diversity is the result of different educational-cultural backgrounds (Francophone, Anglophone, speakers of other languages, or a mixture of these). Many higher education institutions are not open to each other, but they seek to interact with similar universities outside Lebanon. Lately, many private institutions as well as LU have turned to systems similar to European and Anglo-Saxon systems, which would allow for educational mobility among the various institutions.

1/4/5 ➤ There is no comprehensive system for higher education where definitions of curricula, degrees, and courses are agreed upon in such a way that would allow for academic mobility among institutions of higher education.

F. Higher Technical Education

52. Higher technical education includes two levels and leads to on of four degrees: Technical Superior (TS) (3 years), Technical Degree (2 years after TS). Technical

Teaching Degree (4 years after the BT or Baccalaureate of general education, and the Technical Supervisor (M.A.)

- 53. The new framework for Vocational and Technical Education was approved by the Council of Ministers in 2000, where by the TS was listed as one of the higher Vocational and Technical Education degrees, but as the implementation decrees were not issued, the Vocational and Technical Education degrees were deprived from having a clear text specifying their place in the higher education system in Lebanon. In 2002 Law #478 was issued; it specified the minimum requirements for job classification of Vocational and Technical Education in relation to public jobs. Holders of Higher Technical Education degrees were classified as Grade III, but this classification did not meet wide acceptance in the job market.
- 54. Legal texts in Lebanon did not provide a clear definition for higher education (which is supposed to be a higher level than secondary education and is supposed to be offered by licensed educational institutions). This led to the exclusion of higher technical education from the higher education system in Lebanon and to the vague status of this form of education.
- 55. The number of students enrolled in higher Vocational and Technical Education in the academic year 2004-2005 reached about 24000 students, more than 80% of whom were in the TS program. It is also noted that about 55% of students are spread over three service-type specializations while the rest of the students are spread over 37 majors.
- 56. Of the students in higher Vocational and Technical Education in the TS program, 50.4% are in the public sector as opposed to 49.6% in the private sector. In the Technical Degree program, 84.3% of the students are in the public sector and 1507% in the private sectors.
- 57. In the official examination in 2004, the percentage of success was 65% in TS and 51% in the Technical Degree.
- 58. Higher technical education, at the post-secondary level, with its different degrees (TS diploma, Bachelor's, etc...) has an independent academic and administrative organizational structure (General Directorate for Vocational and Technical Education). Curricular development and examinations are done in a centralized fashion, in a manner similar to what happens in the secondary cycle. This centralization is a barrier between technical and vocational education on the one hand and universities and colleges, on the other.
- 1/4/6 > Higher vocational and technical education in Lebanon faces the same problems of the secondary vocational and technical education, such as enrolment, continuation of study and success as enrolment is clustered largely in very few non-industrial specializations. It also faces the following problems; 1) higher vocational and technical education institutes can not be distinguished from technical schools in buildings, administration, faculty, or academic and administrative regulations; and 2) lack of mobility between technical and university education, which reflects negatively on people's desire to join this track and on its chances for expansion and growth.

Part II: Quality Education that contributes to Building the Knowledge Society

5. Education characterized by the high quality of its curricula, institutions, and outcomes; an education that is aligned with national and international standards.

A. Pre-School Education

- 1. The fact that a child could join the first grade without having gone through kindergarten has resulted in discontinuity between pre-school and elementary curricula.
- 2. The new curriculum for pre-school education has many positive characteristics, such as following activity-based learning and adopting a thematic approach with instructional units under each theme. On the other hand, the curriculum suffers from problems related to learning reading, writing, foreign language, mathematics, psychomotor activities, and technology²². There is also confusion about the concept of "mother language" in a curriculum that is too general²³. It is worth noting that while all public pre-school educational institutions follow this curriculum, most free and non-free private institutions follow it only in part²⁴.
- 3. The percentage of specialized teachers holding university or vocational preparation degrees who work in pre-school is less than 30.6% of all pre-school teachers. It is important to point out that, Law #442/2002 states that, it is illegal to "appoint or give an individual a contract for a teacher position unless that individual is a holder of a bachelor's degree from a recognized institution". But the law does not explicitly state that this degree should be in elementary or pre-school education.
- 4. In most cases, a pre-school is part of the general education (especially elementary) teaching facilities with common playgrounds for students of all ages. Non-free private schools use educational aids more than the other schools while public schools make extensive use of teaching materials that are cheaper, less technical, and may be constructed by teachers themselves.
- 5. The school climate in quite a number of schools is not compatible with recent trends in pre-school education. For example, the rate of using educational games is rather low in public schools, subsidized private schools, and schools with low tuition in remote areas away from Beirut. As for the relation between the pre-school and the children's families, especially in public and subsidized private schools, it is far from ideal²⁵.
- 6. A KG unit was established in the MEHE in the seventies; however, the current structure of the Ministry of Education does not include a special unit or department for pre-school education, nor is there at present, in institutions of higher education, a specialization in educational administration specifically for pre-school education. In general, pre-schools are usually administered by principals of elementary schools that have a pre-school component or KG teachers, the majority of whom are non-specialists.

2/5/1 ➤ The Pre-school education shows many weaknesses as evidenced in: 1) the lack of coordination between KG and elementary curricula; 2) problems in the implementation of the curricula; 3) the low percentage of holders of appropriate degrees for teaching in this cycle; 4) inadequate school buildings and educational aids in most cases; 5) the school climate's lack of alignment with modern trends of pre-school education; and 6) the inadequacy of both the school administration and the central administration. These weaknesses are more acute in public and free private kindergartens.

B. General Education

- 7. The last process of curriculum development in Lebanon was an unprecedented one in the history of Lebanon in terms of its methodology and its comprehensive coverage of all cycles and all subject matter areas. However, depended on certain circumstances and on certain individuals who led this effort. Furthermore, the process of developing and coordinating Curricula and school textbooks was not guided by authoritative reference guidelines and documents which are necessary for further revisions as well.
- 8. Although participation of the educational community was much wider than previous times, this partnership was not comprehensive enough; the process should, in the future, involve all parties concerned.
- 9. Issuing the curricula in a detailed form through a ministerial decree reduced their flexibility and adaptability in light of the needs of schools and the new trends in education. It might be advisable to determine the main points of the curricula in a decree that leaves details to a ministerial decision issued on the advice of the Council of Experts.
- 10. There is no system for monitoring the application of the curricula and for providing feedback for purposes of revision and enrichment. What the Office of Educational Counseling Services does centers around visiting schools that have performed poorly on official examinations. Likewise, the General Educational Inspectorate focuses on monitoring the extent of abiding by the curricula or by administrative decisions among teachers.
- 11. The Ministry of Education has not benefited from studies that carried out extensive evaluations of the new curricula²⁶, nor did it benefit from reform efforts sponsored by international organizations. For example, a comprehensive education curriculum was designed for the first cycle classes during the years 1999 and 2000, based on the principle of integration²⁷. School textbooks were prepared, teachers were trained in how to apply this curriculum, and the curriculum was piloted in a few schools. An evaluation of this project was conducted, and relevant recommendations were made²⁸. However, up to 2006, there are no indications of adopting, revising, or abandoning this curriculum.
- 2/5/2 ➤ The latest curriculum development endeavor showed the following weaknesses: 1) the absence of an accompanying evaluation system; 2) issuance of detailed curricula by decrees which reflected itself in the limited flexibility of the curricula to accommodate the

19

needs of schools and to respond to emerging educational trends; 3) delay in the issuance of reference documents that offer guidelines for the development of the curriculum components; and 4) not securing the requirements for adequately applying the curricula.

- 12. In comparison to previous curricula, the educational curricula issued in 1997 represented a significant qualitative change, especially in: 1) their development on the basis of objectives; 2) introduction of new subject matter areas; 3) updating knowledge base; and 4) the adoption of active methodologies. However, studies²⁹ carried out on the curricula showed many weaknesses in quality, as in; 1) the low degree of alignment between general curriculum goals, on the one hand, and general and specific objectives of subject matter areas as well as the content, on the other; 2) weakness in developing a scope and sequence that fits the subject matter, the time allowed, and the learning process; 3) problems with the appropriateness and validity of content; and 4) problems in formulation related to accuracy in using technical terms and in translation which resulted in discrepancies among the Arabic, English, and French versions of the curricula.
- 13. The evaluation of the curricula of different subject matter areas showed that some of these areas have serious problems in their design (Arabic, History, Geography, Philosophy and Civilizations, Music, and Physical Education); other areas have partial problems (English as a First Foreign language, Mathematics, Physics, Biology, Chemistry, Civic Education, Informatics, Technology, Fine Arts, and Theater); the rest of the areas have secondary problems only³⁰.
- 14. There are weaknesses as well in the objectives and contents of the curricula in that the scope of some subject matter areas is too narrow and their content is too wide to be covered in the time allotted to the subject. This is based on the unrealistic assumption that the school year consists of 36 weeks.
- 15. Allowing for mathematics and sciences to be taught in a foreign language as of the third cycles was inherited from the old curricula; however the new curricula confirmed and extended that to the first two cycles. The use of a foreign language as a language of instruction in mathematics and sciences poses problems which negatively affects learning in those two subjects³¹.
- 16. A new system of evaluation has been introduced. But this system has been plagued in its design and application by many problems: 1) an evaluation system based on competencies was adopted four years after implementation of the curricula that were based on objectives; 2) there are loopholes in the new system related to the foundations, principles, and tools of evaluation; 3) the teacher training done along with the introduction of the new system was not adequate, thus turning the evaluation process into a numerical operation instead of using it to evaluate students' performance and to improve the educational process; and 4) The educational facilities and resources needed for the implementation of the new system were not made available³². All these problems made it difficult for teachers to understand and apply the new curricula adequately.
 - 2/5/3 ➤ Although the new curricula represent a qualitative change in comparison to previous curricula, there are still some weaknesses in: 1) lack of alignment among general goals, special objectives and cycle objectives; 2) heavy content in relation to actual teaching weeks; 3) lack of concordance between curriculum objectives and assessment system; and 4) lack of students' proficiency in the foreign language

which reflects negatively on their acquiring competence in mathematics and sciences.

- 17. Weak coordination and the lack of agreed-upon reference conditions for developing school textbooks³³ have brought about negative results, as in: 1) the heavy content is emphasized at the expense of skills, attitudes, and evaluation; 2) the discrepancy in quality among textbooks for different classes and subjects, where the lowest quality has been observed in the area of languages, especially Arabic; and 3) the presence of gender stereotyping and the presence of social-professional stereotypes especially in Arabic textbooks.
- 18. Experience has shown that the decision of CERD to take charge of preparing, printing, and distributing school textbooks has helped ensure that the national textbook is reaching everyone. The experience, however, proved problematic in relation to the absence of an independent authority in charge of developing criteria for textbook development and evaluation as well as monitoring textbook development based on these criteria.
- 2/5/4 ➤ Although the bold step taken to develop school textbooks for all educational cycles has contributed to making the national textbook available to all, it is clear that, at present, there is no single independent authority for monitoring and evaluating textbooks in accordance with pre-determined criteria.
- 19. The academic conditions for appointing secondary school teachers have been modified, which had a negative effect on the quality of education. Before 1979, teachers in public secondary schools used to be appointed on the basis of a 5-year university degree in secondary education (called *certificat d'aptitude professionnelle à l'enseignement secondaire*). There is agreement among educators that the graduates of the Faculty of Education at the Lebanese University at the time constituted a major factor in the revival of secondary education in Lebanon. In 1979, a new system for the teaching diploma in secondary education was established. In 1996, the Ministry of Education decided to appoint as secondary teachers some of those who had been on contract after having them go through a one-year "training session" and not on the basis of the teaching diploma. It is worth noting that the way teachers were appointed and the "training session" did not raise the level of those teachers to that of the teaching diploma graduates of the Faculty of Education.
- 20. A similar loosening of conditions for appointing teachers has also taken place in the pre-school, elementary, and intermediate cycles. Up to 1985, elementary teachers appointed had to be graduates of the Teachers' Colleges. In accordance with decree # 2636, dated 22 August 1985, about 4500 teachers were appointed from among those on contract, after having them go through training sessions. Since then, a new practice for appointing teachers on contract basis was put into place. This occurred in parallel with graduating teachers from Teachers Institutes whereby 3675 teachers graduated between the years 1994 and 2002³⁴. Then came the Law # 442, issued 29 July 2002, which made it possible for university degree holders to be appointed as elementary school teachers in Lebanon. However, the law was not clear about whether the university degree includes educational preparation. Since then teachers with a university degree were contracted without any specification of how they were

- to be chosen. Furthermore, the exclusive admission test stated in the law was not given for reasons related to the legal text, which added another problem to that of the lack of hiring criteria, resulting in job and financial insecurity for these teachers.
- 21. The policies and procedures followed during the last few decades resulted in lowering the standards of the teaching staff in many schools. Thus, the number of those on contract in public schools increased, from 6000 in 1993-1994, to 11000 in 2004-2005, i.e. from 21% to 27% of the total teaching body. Meanwhile, the number of non-degree holders on tenure appointment reached 4500. It is worth noting that those who have only a secondary certificate or less constitutes 33% of teachers in public schools, 82% in subsidized private schools, and 50% in private schools³⁵.
- 22. The expansion of teacher appointment on a discretionary basis in public schools was accompanied by a decrease in the actual teaching load of teachers in a conciliatory move in response to demands of teachers' unions and to consecutive strikes. This has encouraged teachers to take overtime jobs and spend more time outside the school despite serious efforts to deal with this problem through offering tenured teacher overtime in their schools. Not following attendance regulations and not being fulltime at school have become widespread because of the loose application of evaluation and accountability procedures.
- 23. After the new curricula were issued, the Ministry of Education and Higher Learning conducted extensive teacher training workshops for all public and some private school teachers. But this training was held only once and was specifically for the purpose of familiarizing teachers with the new curricula. The evaluation study of the training showed that there were many problems related to planning, organization, instructional materials, trainers' qualifications, training styles, evaluation, and the choice and distribution of the trainees³⁶. In 2000, a project for the continuous training of teachers and principals³⁷ was prepared with the following objectives:
 - a) Preparing a group of trainers (resource persons) to undertake the continuous training of teachers.
 - b) Supporting the six main teacher colleges in districts and gradually all local teacher colleges to become centers for continuous training as well as learning resource centers
 - c) Establishing an information and skills network based on new technologies, specially the internet.
 - d) Developing mechanisms for need assessment and for impact of training on classroom practices
 - The actual implementation of the project started in 2004-2005 in the six main teacher colleges in the mohafazat through regional plans prepared and supervised by the Preparation and Training Office at CERD³⁸. The project aims at training 300 trainers and offering training modules to 20 000 teachers
- 24. There are no criteria for joining the teaching profession in Lebanon except for requiring a 4-year university degree for teaching in public schools. The Equivalence Committee at the MEHE is trusted with giving equivalences of university degrees to the license of Teaching. There are no MEHE professional controls regarding practicing teaching in private schools.
- 2/5/5 ➤ Elementary education in public schools faces serious problems when it comes to the qualifications of its teachers as evidenced by: 1) the high percentage of teachers whose education has stopped at the Baccalaureate level or even before; 2) contracting teachers with university degree on a discretionary basis and without having any

educational preparation, further more, secondary education faces other serious problems with teachers qualifications related to: 1) continuing the practice of contracting of individuals with university degrees to teaching positions without their having educational preparation; 2) appointment of full-time teachers after offering them a short 'professional preparation' session. As for training, there is a large scale project which started in 2004-2005 to offer continuous training for public elementary and secondary teachers.

- 25. The problem of school buildings, in as far as adequacy and the suitability of their locations are concerned, is a chronic one in public education. The "school map" is a project that was conceived a few decades ago, but until now, there has been no conception of a guidance system for choosing school locations in accordance with clear criteria based on the conceived objectives and role of education in Lebanon. One-third of buildings housing schools are rented and do not meet the conditions required for school buildings, and one fifth of them require rehabilitation and renovation³⁹.
- 26. The material resources (laboratories, libraries, workshops, and computers)⁴⁰ in public schools in Lebanon are scarce. In cases where these resources are available in public schools, they are not used effectively in education for reasons relating to school administrations, lack of technicians, and lack of interest in what is not tested on official examinations.

2/5/6 ➤ Public schools face the problem of inadequate buildings, facilities and educational provisions as it relates to their availability, suitability, quality, and use in teaching and learning.

- 27. Few research studies and some data are available on instructional environment (classroom teaching) in public and private schools; the few that exist⁴¹ point to traditional methods of instruction in mathematics and sciences and to the absence of the active student-centered methods of teaching suggested in the new curricula. The available data on school climate in Lebanon comes from the TIMSS 2003 which places Lebanon as the second from last among the 8 lowest countries on the list in the perceptions of teachers of how healthy the school climate (which includes relations between students, teachers, administration, and parents) is⁴².
- 2/5/7 ➤ Although the new curricula emphasized a learner-centered approach to the learning-teaching process and the adoption of active learning methodology, actual school practices point to 1) the dominance of teacher-centered teaching, and 2) problems with the school climate represented by the weak relations among students, teachers, administration, and parents.
- 28. School administration in public schools manifests chronic weaknesses that might mostly be due to: 1) limited authority given to the principal; 2) the conditions for the

23

- appointment of a principal that are in operation; these conditions do not include any preparation (Diploma or BA) in educational leadership and administration); and, 3) some of these conditions are not being applied as is the case with the condition that principals should take and pass a course in educational administration offered at the Lebanese University before their appointment goes into effect (as stipulated in Law 320 dated 5/4/2001).
- 29. The Ministry of Education, through the Educational Development Project, launched in 2005 a program known as "Developing Leadership Among School Principals" for a two-year period to cover 30% of schools by 2007. A number of trainees will be groomed to become trainers for their colleagues. The project will specify the policies and general legislations that will govern the training of public school principals. Though this is stipulated in the project, until now, there has not been an institution for follow-up and continuous training of principals, and there has not been a system to follow up on the effect of training on administrative performance in schools.
- 2/5/8 ➤ Public schools exhibit problems in their administration in at least four areas: 1) the limited authority given to the principal to lead and administer, 2) conditions and terms of appointment which do not require a university degree in educational administration, 3) a lack of adherence to the conditions of going through a training program at the Lebanese University specified in the laws that govern the appointment of principals, and 4) absence of a system of performance appraisal. To date, there is no institutionalization of preparing principals in leadership and educational administration and providing them with continuous professional development
- 30. The evaluation study of students' achievement in all subjects as measured by students' performance on tests based on the competencies formulated by CERD, showed that there are inherent weaknesses in the competencies of basic subject matter areas, such as languages, mathematics, and sciences⁴³. Furthermore, Lebanon participated in the TIMSS 2003 international study whose results showed that Lebanon ranked a weak 31 among 45 countries in mathematics and a weaker 41 in sciences⁴⁴. Compared to the eight Arab Countries that participated in the study, Lebanon came first in mathematics and last in science.
- 2/5/9 The learning outcomes in languages, mathematics, and science are low in comparison with required competencies and in relation to international standards.

C. Vocational and Technical Education

31. The number of teaching and administrative staff in Vocational and Technical Education is a little more than 9000, about 80% of whom are contracted by the hour. The increasing opportunities for Vocational and Technical Education and the

inability to hire full-timers on tenure do not justify the inflated numbers of those on contract especially that many of them do not teach more than 4 hours a week.

- 32. Most teaches on contract in Vocational and Technical Education are university graduates and graduates of higher vocational education. In general, they are not prepared for this type of teaching. Rarely, do people with experience in the jobs market get employed. The lack of a policy for hiring people on contract for Vocational and Technical Education has resulted in negative fallout that lowered its internal and external competence and led to discrepancies in acquired skills between one school and another or between one section and another in the same school.
- 33. There are no specific detailed standards for employment by contract or for hiring teachers and trainers in Vocational and Technical Education. Furthermore, the Technical Education Institute plays no role in preparing and training teachers. In addition: the Institute has in the last seven years graduated students with Technical Education degree in specialization incompatible with the current needs of Vocational and Technical Education and with the needed skills.
- 34. The almost-total dependence on teachers on contract for teaching and training complicates the organization of administrative work and educational coordination at the level of the central administration and schools and limits the ability to develop and train the teaching staff on account of the large number of those on contract, their weak commitment, discrepancies in their performance.
- 35. Most teaching staff in Vocational and Technical Education lack proper academic and professional qualification. There are no reliable data on the percentages of those qualified in terms of specialization, professional conduct, relations with the job market, and having the knowledge and experience needed for teaching and training students.
- 36. The Vocational and Technical Education system lacks the criteria and procedures needed for pre or in-service training or for continuous training in the use of modern technical and educational media and technology or for skill enhancement. This constitutes one of the main reasons for the low internal and external effectiveness of Vocational and Technical Education Preparing and training trainers and teachers requires continuity and enormous human and financial resources as well as advanced work dynamics if we take into account the number and diversity of specializations and levels of Vocational and Technical Education
- 37. The conditions for appointing school directors in technical education are the same as those in general education and do not take in consideration the special nature of technical education and its needs. It is to be noted that a large number of school and institute directors are secondary school teachers. The centralized system of administration does not grant directors authority in academic and technical matters commensurate with their position and responsibilities.
- 38. No evaluation has taken place of the learning outcomes of the curricula developed in 2000, which has been implemented as of 2003, against national and international standards. However, facts show that there is a wide gap between the stated objectives and the actual performance. The reasons for the gap might be: 1) the extensive nature of the subject matter which could not be covered in the time allotted (supposedly 30 teaching weeks, but in reality not more than 25 weeks), and 2) the lack of development of new teaching and assessment methods and techniques and official examinations.
 - 2/5/10 ➤ The secondary vocational and technical education curricula face serious problems related to the qualifications of their academic and administrative staff, as evidenced in: 1) absence of a

mechanism or standards or additional special conditions for appointing teachers in technical and vocational education; 2) the inefficiency of the majority of teachers and resorting to contracting teachers who have not had any previous educational preparation; 3) the low level of academic and educational qualifications of the majority of teachers because of lack of in-service training to enable them needed for keeping in step with scientific and technical innovations; 3) the lack of needed facilities in school; 4) the lack of development of new teaching methods and evaluation techniques; and 5) lack of qualifications of the administrative staff and the absence of criteria and mechanisms for appointing administrators of institutions of vocational and technical education.

- 39. The new vocational and technical education curricula were issued in 2000. They were based on the system of competency teaching or performance skills that students are supposed to acquire. But these curricula have not been evaluated, and no monitoring or feedback mechanisms have been devised to help revise and develop these curricula continuously and thus constrained its development in line with technological development.
- 40. Despite the fact that curricula constitute one of the most important components in all types of education, teachers and trainers in Vocational and Technical Education do not find any reference documents of adopted textbooks that will enable them to determine the volume and level of knowledge and competencies that students should master and be tested in. this situation leads each teacher to presenting materials in his/her own way, which results in discrepancies in knowledge, competencies, and skills acquired between one school and another, and sometimes between on section and another in the same school.

Having a reference textbook in Vocational and Technical Education contributes to the guaranteeing of a minimum acceptable level of knowledge and skills in all vocational schools and provides teachers with the special reference documents of the curriculum which should include –in addition to names of courses, chapter headings, number of theory and practicum hours- detailed content for teaching and training that would allow for methodical sequencing of specializations, levels, and years.

2/5/11 ➤ Lack of an official textbook that could constitute a reference document in the teaching process and help students acquire knowledge and competencies required in the curriculum.

- 41. The practicum courses in vocational education are mainly theoretical, depend on rote learning, and below the needed level in content and quantity, the whole educational system is not based on recent educational methodology trends. Furthermore, evaluation techniques, whether at the school level or at the level of official examinations, have not been developed to go along with the curriculum development carried out in the year 2000.
- 42. Although a great number of Vocational and Technical Education institutes meet the set physical specifications, there is imbalance and deficiency in the school climate where the relations among students, faculty, administration, and parents seen to be weak.

- 2/5/12 ➤ Despite the stress in modern educational approaches on considering the student as the center of the teaching-learning process and on using active methods in teaching, the current situation shows: 1) weakness in active teaching methods, and 2) deficiency in school climate represented by weak relation among students, faculty, administration, and parents.
 - 43. Vocational and Technical Education essentially lacks different quality standards to measure all components of the educational process, and internal and external teaching and training competencies. Similarly, there is a need to set comprehensive quality standards for evaluation of degrees and the institutions that issue them.
 - 44. The MEHE launched several attempts to improve the elements of internal competence/adequacy of Vocational and Technical Education program, but many reasons restricted the success of these attempts, such as 1) lack of coordination between the BT and Ts programs; 2) lack of concordance among specialization programs within the same school or institute, coupled with the large number of fields of study and the small number of students enrolled in them, which results in high cost of equipment and education with little practical or economic returns; 3) weakness in level of provision of equipment or its unsuitability, especially in Information Technology, in addition to the rarity of it specialists at these schools; 4) the low level of foreign language proficiency of Vocational and Technical Education graduates; 5) lack of specific criteria for admitting students to the various majors, which results in lowering quality; 6) a centralized examination system in Vocational and Technical Education, similar to the one in general education, with applies to all levels and majors in clear contradiction of job market needs and Vocational and Technical Education requirements; 7) lack of professional national standards for program and course description that could be used as the basis for determining levels of the educational process and its curriculum, program, faculty, administrative trainers, and facilities; and 8) lack of evaluation of Vocational and Technical Education learning outcomes and lack of classification of Vocational and Technical Education teaching institutions in order to show the quality of teaching and training offered by these institutions.
 - 45. The most important reason for the low quality of vocational and technical education is that students are accepted into the technical baccalaureate or vocational secondary certificate-Double System classes without having to have passed the Intermediate Certificate (Brevet) or even without obtaining an acceptable grade average.
 - 46. Vocational and technical education secondary students lack career guidance, a lack which leads students to enroll in a specialization he/she does not want or does not suit his/her qualifications or the needs of the labor market. This will affect the student's educational continuation and success.
 - 47. There hasn't been any assessment, internally or externally, of the quality the vocational and technical education or follow-up studies on graduates in order to collect data and feedback to improve the teaching and/or administration in vocational and technical education. There is also laxity in important matters such as attendance of students, excessive vacations, and lack of control of teachers'

performance, late beginning and early conclusion of the academic year. All of these lead to lowering standards of students and consequently lowering the passing grade. 48. Technical equipment cannot be separated from the curriculum as it constitutes an integral part of it and an essential element of the process of teaching and training. The present situation of vocational schools requires reconsideration of its programs and how they are implemented because many of them do not function properly. In addition, there are clear discrepancies among Vocational and Technical Education institutions in the availability of laboratories, equipment, and workshops, which reflects negatively on educational performance and contradicts the principles of equal opportunity and quality education for all.

- 2/5/13 > V.T.E, especially in the secondary cycle, is characterized by its low quality, as evidenced in: 1) lack of specific criteria for admission, resulting in lowering of educational standards; 2) lack of national standards for vocational description and classification; 3) weak compatibility between curricula and the needs of the job market, lack of concordance between the curricula and programs of Vocational and Technical Education levels, and lack of a continuous dynamism for revising and updating curricula; 4) weakness or lack of compatibility of many technological equipment and educational media with the requirements of the educational process, 5) lack of career guidance for Vocational and Technical Education students; 6) low levels of proficiency of Vocational and Technical Education graduates in foreign languages; and 7) lack of quality standards and feedback.
 - 49. One major feature of vocational and technical education is its special relation with the labor market whether in terms of needs, skills, and competencies or in training of students. However, this relation is weak in Lebanon on all level of vocational and technical education with the exception of Technical Secondary Diploma-Double System which is dominated by practicum and on-site training (despite the poor level of students joining this program). Moreover, there is no mechanism in place to allow the participation of economic and production sectors in vocational and technical education and no system of incentives for employers, which results in gaps between what the students learn, and what they will face after graduation. This reflects negatively on the quality of education and on its compatibility with the real needs of the production sector and on the ability to compete in the job market.
 - 2/5/14 ➤ Weak communication with job market and the absence of real partnership between vocational and technical education and those benefiting from it, on the one hand, and general education, both public and private, on the other.

28

6. Higher education of good quality in its curricula, institutions, and outcomes compatible with national and international standards.

A. Higher Education

- 50. The available data on quality in higher education indicate that the quality of higher education and that of the Lebanese university suffers from serious problems related to educational climate, faculty, curriculum, and research, though there are differences among universities⁴⁵.
- 51. Regarding private higher education, the MEHE decreed in 1996 standards that should be met in order to certify new higher education institutions. However, the MEHE certified on 5/10/1996 new collages in existing institutions without applying the standards it decreed. In other words, the MEHE considered the new standards to be applicable only in the future. Until today, no new private higher education law has been issued to replace that of 26/12/1961 despite the fact that the special committee appointed by the Minster in 2005 to propose a new law for Higher Education has done so. But the proposal has not yet been approved by the Council of Ministers.
- 52. The issue of quality of education in Higher Education is becoming a vital issue in Lebanon, especially with the branches, and specializations and the expansion of private higher education in its institutions, colleges, and programs. On the one hand, no procedures or regulation were set to ensure quality education and, on the other hand, private higher education institutions did not abide by the laws and decrees issued by the government. It is also noticeable that the recommendation of international organizations in this respect have not been adopted, especially in relation to transparency of Higher Education institutions, publishing information about them, institutionalizing self-education, independent of university and government agencies, for the purpose of evaluating learning outcomes and equipping graduates with needed qualifications.
- 2/6/1≯ Higher Education in Lebanon is characterized at present by: 1) lack of a national policy for higher education, in the private and public sectors, that are compatible with international standards; 2) the ancient systems governing private higher education and those governing the Lebanese University; 3) lack of frameworks, structures procedures, and standards for quality control; 4) higher education administration lack of framework, regulation, and human resources for monitoring institutions of higher education in order to ensure their abiding by licensing conditions regarding academic and building qualifications.

B. Lebanese University

- 53. The Lebanese University suffers form the low ration of graduates to that of enrolled students. This low ration is attributed to the inflated number of first year students, only a few of whom make it to the second year, in addition to the availability and milieu of academic programs, couples with the almost total absence of a guidance and counseling system, not to mention the learners themselves. This inflation in first year numbers, in addition to exhausting human and material resources, affects negatively the teaching context and decreases the chances for continuation and success.
- 2/6/2≯ The Lebanese University has a great discrepancy in numbers between those who enroll and those who graduate due to: 1) inflated numbers of first year students and the low percentage of promotion to second year; 2) low number of available educational programs (majors) and low income; 3) unavailability of proper educational climate; 4) lack of a guidance and counseling system for students; and 5) inadequacy of the appropriate learning achievement of students.
 - 54. The Lebanese University has attracted wide attention in the last few years that focused on identifying and diagnosing its problems and making recommendations for reform and development, especially by the Union of full-time faculty⁴⁶, some independent academic groups and associations⁴⁷, and international organizations ⁴⁸ In 2004, Lebanese University issued a self-evaluation report⁴⁹ which summarized its problems in the following: 1) the legal ties between LU and the Lebanese government, which puts it under political pressure; 2) the scarcity of available financial resources and total dependence on the government for budget; 3) inadequate and unclear reference texts for providing a framework for its operation in the form of laws and implementation decrees and their inconsistencies and contradictions; 4) weakness in databases and means of professional developments for its staff; 5) lack of a system of accountability and performance appraisal. The initiative of self-evaluation by LU is a serious move that should have been followed by the institutionalization of self-evaluation and translating the results into action for developing the academic and the structural aspects; identifying what is expected of those concerned inside and outside the University and complementing it with expert external evaluation.
 - 55. LU has some major deficiencies and exhibits worrying signs, among which are: 1) the high number of contracts by hour to meet teaching needs; 2) the lack of commitment of the part of many of the full-time faculty; 3) rise in the average age of full-time faculty; and 4) lack of clear, publicized policies regarding academic research, including regulations for research activity, a system for evaluating research, and incentives.
- 2/6/3≯ The problems of quality of education at the Lebanese University are attributed to :1) the absence of a reform program and the lack of needed resources; 2) the loss of autonomy in the last decades; 3) high percentage of contracts by hour to meet needs; 4) rise in average age of full-time and tenured faculty; and 5) lack of

accountability and performance appraisal in the University as a whole.

2/6/4> Research activity in higher education in Lebanon remains far from satisfactory, especially at LU and many private universities, which reflects negatively on the enhancement of the academic quality of faculty members and on the quality of education.

C. Higher Technical Education

- 56. Higher vocational and technical education is plagued by similar problems to those of secondary vocational and technical education, yet it has additional problems in quality as a consequence of its being run in a manner similar to that of secondary education rather than to that of higher education. Public institutes and colleges do not have any special characteristics that set them apart from secondary technical schools, whether in buildings and facilities, administration, faculty qualifications, or their internal operating systems. In the private sector, the same institution could be licensed to grant degrees at three educational levels: vocational, technical secondary, and higher (education). In other words, higher education in these areas takes place in the same context as the pre-university education; i.e. under the same administration, in the same facilities, and with the same faculty.
- 57. Special legislation for classifying and ranking teachers in Vocational and Technical Education have been established, but they are still not implemented; nor are they consulted when appointing teachers in technical institutions.
- 58. There are no scientific departments or divisions in the institutes similar to those in the university. Furthermore, public institute employees are considered employees of the General Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education
- 59. A decision was made regarding criteria for licensing higher technical institutes in the private sector, but this included TS only.
- 60. Official examination for TS, technical diploma, and technical teaching diploma take place in a similar manner to that of secondary cycle official examination.
- 61. There is no partnership in the public sector between general education and VT.E. at all levels, and there is no cooperation between public ad private sectors. This situation, added to the lack of a national description of programs, degrees, and courses, limits the possibility of students' movement among sectors, tracks, and majors available even within the same institution.
- 62. Higher technical education lacks an effective unit for monitoring quality and excellence that would provide the minimum standards required in an academic institution and would ensure that the institution is involved in improvement and self-evaluation efforts and using the results of the evaluation in making academic and professional decisions.
- 2/6/5 ➤ Higher technical education faces similar problems to those of the secondary cycle as they are listed under the same system. However, there are additional problems that affect its quality as evidenced by: 1) the absence of an authority or administration responsible for higher technical education; separate from secondary education; 2) exclusion of vocational and technical education from the higher education system in Lebanon; and 3) absence of an organizing and administration similar to or close to that of high education

- 7. Education oriented towards the development of knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for handling information and the intensive use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT).
- 63. The general education curricula issued in 1997 did not include any objectives for Information Technology and Communication (ICT); however, they did include one specific objective for technology education in general, namely, the formation of a citizen "who is aware of the importance of technology and capable of using, developing, and interacting with it in a conscious accurate manner." Aside from Informatics, the cycle objectives and the specific objectives for subject matter areas have mentioned, only in passing, the use of IT in education.
- 64. 50. The introduction of Informatics as a subject matter in schools was one of the innovations introduced by the 1997 curricula. Although the stated curriculum objectives have been rather ambitious and included building knowledge, attitudes, and skills for dealing with information and using it in learning, the curriculum content is limited in many aspects: 1) The curriculum is limited to information skills and does not stress the use of IT and communication in teaching other subject matter areas or in autonomous learning; 2) The current curriculum covers only grades 7-12 at the rate of one class period every week; and 3) Informatics as a subject matter is not assigned any weight in school evaluation or in official examinations. It is for this reason that the Informatics curricula are not taught in many private and most public schools.
- 65. One of the obstacles facing the contribution of education to building an information society is the delay and slow pace of equipping public schools with computer laboratories and internet access. In 2003, the Ministry of Education launched a project with the purpose of equipping 250 intermediate and secondary schools with computer labs. Information collected from schools show that 56% of public schools possessed one or more computers⁵⁰ while private schools had computer labs or individual computers for use in education and administration. There are no accurate statistics concerning the extent of internet access at public and private schools.
- 66. Another obstacle is the lack of qualified Informatics teachers in public schools. Lately, the Ministry of Education launched many experimental projects in this respect, such as the "Manara" project that included 17 public schools, the "Partners in Lebanon" project which involved 200 teachers, and the MOS project that involved 75 teachers a year over a period of five years. However, these projects remain limited in their scope and do not follow a comprehensive plan, the lack of which renders such projects un-synchronized in their goals, financing, and mechanisms of training. 67. Even if equipment is made available, the greatest obstacle will be how to use the ICT in teaching in such a way as to make technology an effective tool that aids students in learning, both in school and at home, and not just in locating information but also in answering questions, choosing relevant information, and constructing knowledge through individual and group efforts.
- 2/7/1 ➤ The contribution of general education in Lebanon to building an information society remains limited as evidenced by: 1) the current Informatics curriculum covers only the development of

basic skills. Informatics education, in its curriculum and applications, does not aim to develop knowledge, attitudes, and skills needed for handling information or for using information and communication technology in acquiring knowledge in various subject matter areas and domains; 2) the curriculum is not followed in many schools in general, and in most public schools in particular; 3) the basic skills in informatics are not tested at school or in official examinations; and 4) the multiplicity slowness, and contradictions in teacher preparation in knowledge and skills pertaining to the use of information technology in teaching and learning.

8. Education that develops the general education of individuals and provides them with lifelong learning skills, especially critical thinking skills and moral reasoning.

68. The fast pace of cultural, economic, and political change in modern societies calls for skills, attitudes, and beliefs that would help an individual to accept change and actively adapt to and interact with it. What helps the individual most in this respect is his/her ability to remain a lifelong learner. Does education in Lebanon contribute to preparing individuals who are able to live and work in a changing modern society and to continue to learn throughout their life? Education in Lebanon is dominated by pure academic concerns and matters normally does not deal with social and environmental problems and with contemporary changes in modern society. 69. The 1997 general education curricula did not list under its general goals any goal for development of critical thinking and moral reasoning⁵¹ to prepare students to adapt to change and to the demands of living and working in changing modern societies though it mentioned moral commitment. Although, the general goals of some subjects noted the need to develop some general thinking abilities, such as problem-solving in mathematics, it is worth noting that the curriculum evaluation of the new curricula showed that the general thinking skills, if referred to in the curricula, have not been reflected in the goals of different subjects, textbooks, and teaching practices⁵². In general, education in Lebanon does not help students acquire the skills (critical thinking abilities and moral reasoning), attitudes (accepting others), and beliefs (learning does not end with formal education) that develop their ability to live and work in a changing society and to become lifelong learners.

2/8/1 > The curricula, teaching methods, and accompanying activities do not adequately address, in one subject matter area or across subject matter areas, the development of lifelong learning, critical thinking and moral reasoning and related attitudes.

70. There are deficiencies in the general education targeted by the curricula as indicated in the small share allotted to it; this is accompanied by marginalization of arts in instruction and assessment which results in total neglect of arts in many schools. Consequently, arts are totally neglected as indicated by the small share of

34

arts in extra-curricular activities (art clubs and activities) and the lack of human and material resources.

2/8/2 ➤ There is a deficiency in general education in the curricula; likewise, there is deficiency in the area of art education (music, drawing, theater, acting) and in extra-curricular activities.

Part III: Education that Contributes to Social Integration

9. Education that develops citizenship in its three dimensions: National identity, civic participation, and human partnership.

A. National Identity

- 1. The new 1997 curricula have adopted points (a) and (b) of the preamble to the Lebanese Constitution regarding national identity (General Principles for the Curriculum) and derived from it general objectives such as shaping a citizen who is a) proud of his/her country Lebanon and of his/her belonging to it, and committed to its causes, and b) proud of his/her Arab identity and of his/her belonging to the Arab world, and committed to both. The issue of national identity is present in the general objectives of five subject matters; namely, History, Civic Education, Arabic, Geography, and Physical Education (P.E). According to studies done, this is probably due to lack of alignment and harmony among the general goals of the curricula and the general as well as specific goals of subject matter areas in all cycles; between the objectives and the content; and between the curriculum and the textbooks⁵³. Such disharmony would later reflect on what the textbook says, what the teacher says, and what the students say. This disharmony is paralleled by discrepancies among schools regarding the national socialization.
- 2. On another level, it is observed that the curricula exhibit a weakness in synthesizing "national identity" with other related terms such as cultural openness and diversity for example. While "cultural openness" is mentioned in the general objectives of foreign languages, "national identity" appears in the general objectives of Arabic. Similarly, the concept of "living together" appears along the concept of national identity, in one of the general objectives of Arabic and then disappears from the special objectives of Arabic, and from the general and special objectives of all other subjects.
- 3. Thirdly, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education was not able to design a curriculum for History, or to develop textbooks for it, nine years after the issuing of the new curricula, whose general objectives stipulate the shaping of a citizen "who is aware of his/her collective national history, away from narrow partisanship, and towards building a united society that is open to other cultures" (General Objectives, article 2-2, item D). The history curricula were issued in 2000 (Decree number 3175) and textbooks were written accordingly, however, the curricula and textbooks were not implemented. Students are still studying in history textbooks based on 1968 curricula for the secondary cycle and on 1970 curricula for elementary and intermediate cycles; official examination are based on those curricula. Studies have shown a divergence in the political culture of the Lebanese with respect to ancestors (the good and the bad)⁵⁴, and to geopolitics (friends and enemies). This divergence is directly mirrored in schools through their respective social milieu. Studies have shown also that the textbooks of geography, civic education, and sociology do not emphasize skills and attitudes⁵⁵.

- 3/9/1 ➤ The role of the school in building of national belongingness exhibits weaknesses in at least three forms: 1) the weak connection between national identity and other related terms such as cultural openness, diversity, confessional identities, and common living (living together); 2) differences among schools, and between the textbook and what the teacher says about the topic of "education for citizenship"; and 3) weakness in helping learners acquire knowledge that could be turned into attitudes and behavior that embody national belongingness.

 B. Civic Participation
- 4. Lebanon is a civic state; it is neither secular nor religious. The relationship among its individuals and groups is governed by the constitution and the law, except for personal affairs⁵⁶. From this perspective, the civic aspect of citizenship upbringing deals with at least three issues: 1) the political regime in Lebanon as established by the constitution, the related laws (the election law among others) and the related concepts (democracy, liberty, and political involvement); 2) the culture of law and related concepts (equity, merit, the power of the law, individual rights and obligations etc.); and 3) justice and related concepts (regional balanced development, group rights, etc.).
- 5. The "general principles" of the curricula refer to two of the above-mentioned points in the articles that deal with a) the rule of law, b) respect for individual and group freedoms as guaranteed by the Constitution, and c) participation in social and political activities (preamble to the curricula, the "on the social level" section). However, "the general objectives of the curricula" do not mention any of these points. For instance, the term "democracy" is not properly listed under Civic Education.
- 6. Secondly⁵⁷, the analysis of textbooks showed that they are based on rote learning of values and knowledge but not practicing skills. Thus, students do not participate in activities related to the culture of law (condemning corruption or condemning fanaticism, discrimination, partiality, etc...) or in preparatory activities necessary for future political participation (election of class representatives).
- 7. Thirdly, the educational system in Lebanon places more weight on the duties and obligations of the students than on their rights. Moreover, the rules and regulations do not include anything about the rights of, nor about catering for, students with special needs except for Decree 16417/2006 which exempts learners with special needs from sitting for official examinations and Decree 16614/2006 which exempts gifted students from having to go through all the pre-university classes. Nor do schools guarantee and practice such rights as the right of students to comfort and proper entertainment. Furthermore, although corporal punishment is prohibited, students' rights are often violated. Finally, Civic Education as a school subject does not deal with developing moral reasoning in particular and moral education in general.

3/9/2 ➤ The role of the school in civic education is rather weak; this weakness is reflected in different forms such as 1) weakness in the skills, and application aspects of the curriculum; 2) lack of communication between the school and the local society; and 3) inflexibility of the internal systems of schools. All this leads to inadequate acquisition of civic education.

C. Human Partnership

- 8. One study showed that The Civic Education curriculum from grade 1 till the end of secondary cycle⁵⁸ is saturated with the articles of the Human Rights Declaration. However, this curriculum does not sufficiently deal with the Declaration of Child Rights of 1959 and Article 39 of the Children's Rights Convention. The general goals of curricula do not often include reference to international conventions to help spread these basic concepts in the various subject areas (other than civic education).
- 9. Moreover, curricula do not adequately cover global concerns and challenges such as natural disasters, pollution problems, and issues related to pollution, poverty and diseases.
- 10. The efforts of the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD) in collaboration with the UNICEF, in terms of providing adequate training for teachers in order to familiarize them with the concepts of human and children's rights and with the Charter of the Rights of the Child, as part of the Global Education Project, are indeed notable, yet such efforts remain rather meager and scattered, not rising to the level of becoming a continuous institutional endeavor.
- 3/9/3 ➤ The role of education in the development of human partnership falls short of expectations although the fact that the curricula cover the values called for in international declarations and treaties as well as global environmental and humanitarian issues.
 - 10. Education that contributes to social cohesion and provides learners with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for living together in a diverse society.
 - 11. It is not the duty of education to create social cohesion, yet it can cement social cohesion among the new generations in a way that makes them more immune to rapid division. Establishing Education could achieve this through providing social mix, opportunities for interaction, and through providing students with the knowledge, values, and skills necessary for "living together".

A. Spaces for Social Mix

12. One study⁵⁹ has shown that student composition of universities in Lebanon is usually characterized by sectarian homogeneity. Excluding the

Lebanese University (LU) branches in distant regions, where geographic population distribution explains the sectarian composition; the real problem lies in universities located in Beirut and Mount Lebanon. In these two confessionally diverse regions which receive students from other geographical regions, only few faculties in few universities reflect this diversity and provide room for social mix. The other private universities are characterized by sectarian homogeneity. The highest percentage of sectarian homogeneity (more than 90%) is detected in the "First Branch" (Muslims) and the "Second Branch" (Christians) of LU.

- 13. Secondly, on the level of faculty representation, except for the Union of Full-Time Professors which brings under its banner professors from all branches and faculties of LU, there exists no union of professors in private universities, or a union of professors that combine LU and private universities. Inter-university student unions do not exist either; the National Association for the Students of the LU was never revived after the 1975-1990 war; each branch has its own independent student union. However, at the level of pre-university education, plenty of opportunities for mixing at the level of faculty representation are available through the Union of Secondary School Teachers in Public Education, the Association of Elementary School Teachers in Public Education, the Association of Vocational Education Teachers, and the Syndicate of Private School Teachers. All these organizations come together under "the Teachers' Bureau" which leads common action (strikes, demonstrations, sit-ins, etc...) among the various sectors of the teaching body there also special associations for teachers of French and English.
- 14. Thirdly, there are also three associations for owners of private schools which are: the Association of Private School Owners, Union of Private Academic Institution, and Association of Owners of free private school. On the other hand, most schools tend to be part of separate one-color associations that lack diversity and are known as bureaus, general secretariats, or directorates according to the association they belong to.
- 3/10/1 ➤ The spaces for social mix in education in Lebanon have shrunk considerably during the last few years at the levels of university student composition. This problem is most acute in the Lebanese University and in public education in general, where there is total absence of student unions, including the Union of Lebanese University Students which existed before the civil was. Most student unions are now confessionally homogenous. Social integration is, however, achieved at the level of unions of university and secondary school teachers as well as at the level of unions of teachers and of private schools.

B. Opportunities for Interaction

15. Opportunities for interaction among educational institutions are very limited. The interaction is confined to private and public schools participating in the UNESCO program, in addition to bilateral cooperation between some schools and to occasional meetings of some independent private schools. But the bulk of organized interaction takes place within the one-color educational institutions which belong to one group.

- 16. Secondly, there is no published information about extracurricular activities conducted by some schools for the purpose of interaction between their students and students of other institutions within frameworks of common interests or around topics of general interest to all participants. These activities that include health, civic, scout and sport activities are organized by schools to enable students with common interests and concerns to interact with one another. But the lack of availability of information about extracurricular activities may be evidence of the absence of such activities. At any rate, participation of public schools in internal (within the same school) or external (with other schools) activities to offer opportunities for interaction is limited in its significance.
- 17. Thirdly, there are initiatives taken by outside parties and nongovernmental organizations (NGO's) that take the form of special programs for training teachers in specific areas (peace education and conflict resolution, education for democracy, and the culture of law). Participating teachers in these programs come from different private and public schools, and, thus, these teachers are given the opportunity to interact with one another. Moreover, periodic educational conferences are organized by the Association of Secondary School Teachers and by educational institutions and universities; these conferences are attended by a varied numbers of teachers. Very often, interaction at these conferences is limited to the educators and teachers of the institution organizing the event.
- 3/10/2 ➤ Education in Lebanon provides limited opportunities for interaction among its institutions, students, and teachers; the most prominent of these are training sessions and activities for teachers. Extracurricular activities, especially in public schools, are also scarce, whether within the same school or in conjunction with other schools. Finally, professional activities that promote interaction among teachers are rather limited.

C. Education, Values and Skills for Living in a Diverse Society

- 18. The new curricula encouraged cooperative team and field work to broaden the educational horizons of students and to help them acquire the competencies of listening/attention to what others say, discussion, acceptance of different opinions, and expansion of horizons of knowledge. Cooperative teamwork was applied in schools with means that allow for that and whose teachers were trained to use this approach. But the lack of such needed facilities and capabilities at most schools has rendered textbook subject matter about Self and Other, about cooperative teamwork, and about dialogue material for mere memorization.
- 3/10/3➤ Education in Lebanon offers limited opportunities for the acquisition of knowledge and values needed for "living together" because such opportunities are not accompanied by classroom and school practices and activities that turn them into skills and behaviors.

40

11. Education that contributes to social mobility: horizontally, among geographical locations, and vertically, among social strata.

19. The degree of horizontal social mobility among geographical locations and vertical social mobility among social classes is a reflection of the degree of the coherence in social space in a certain country. It also shows the opportunities offered to individuals to move back and forth in this space. Furthermore, it is an expression of the degree of the feeling that the scope of mobility within society as a whole is unhindered and without any visible or non-visible, official or nonofficial, restrictions. Very often, it is higher education that is expected to provide the chances for social mobility. This is due to the fact that elementary schools (and institutions of basic education in general) are usually closely related to the local community. Secondary education, on the other hand, lies between these two extremes (basic education, on the one hand, and higher education, on the other), a position that makes it difficult to assess its effect on social mobility. Therefore, in this document, the diagnosis of social mobility is restricted to higher education.

A. Horizontal Social Mobility

- 20. Data shows⁶⁰ that where geographical mobility in higher education in Lebanon exists, it tends to be from the distant regions (periphery) to the Greater Beirut area (center) and not in the opposite direction. It follows that the branches of the Lebanese University in the North, South and Bekaa are the most geographically homogenous higher education institutions because more than 80% of their enrolled students belong, according to their identity cards (their place of birth), to the same region in which the branch is located. This shows that the presence of higher education institutions in the distant locations is a mere geographical fact and does not hold any added value in terms of specializations or academic characteristics that might attract students from other regions, which demonstrates the limits of "regionally balanced development" in higher education.
- 21. Regarding the movement from the university to the job market, a study⁶¹ shows that there is a tendency towards segmentation in study/job market. In other words, there are almost-closed institutions that offer pre-university education, university education and job opportunities. About half of the university students tend to find work within the same region in which they had studied whereas the other half tend to find work in a region different from the one they were born in. The exception to this rule are university students in Beirut and Mount Lebanon who tend to work within their regions because most economic institutions are found in these regions, keeping in mind that professional geographic mobility from other regions tends to go in the direction of these two regions. On the other hand, the tendency of movement for career purposes from one region to the other (other than towards Beirut and Mount Lebanon) is almost null. In addition, the tendency to leave the country to work outside surpasses, in importance, the tendency for geographical career mobility within Lebanon on account of the current crisis and the rarity of job opportunities.

3/11/1 ➤ The contribution of higher education to geographical mobility is limited, as the general tendency is either for settlement of students within the same region or their mobility from remote regions to specific universities in the Greater Beirut area.

B. Vertical Social Mobility

- 22. A study has shown⁶² that higher education contributes to an increasing social mobility for about 44% of its attendees irrespective of where they start and where they reach on the social scale. A striking result of this study reveals that the contribution of the Lebanese University to social mobility is less than that of private universities. This conclusion may be explained by a host of converging factors that relate to the connection between private universities and certain institutions that find work for their graduates of the trust of economic institutions in private education on the assumption that might be unjustified, that these old private institutions provide better education that LU does. Moreover, specializations in Humanities (such as literature, social and political sciences, education and mass communication, etc...) don't contribute to mobility in the same way that specializations such as engineering, medicine, and law do. However, good quality education doesn't help in mobility if the financial cost constitutes an obstacle to enrollment (especially in private colleges). A study has revealed⁶³ that financial aid offered by universities such as the American University of Beirut or by other granting agencies such as the Hariri Foundation has had great positive impact on mobility in Lebanon.
- 23. A study has shown⁶⁴ that mobility between various types of pre-university education and various types of higher education is highly limited. Thus, the highest concentration of graduates of private schools will be in private universities whereas graduates of public schools will join the Lebanese University (especially open colleges).
- 3/11/2 ➤ The contribution of higher education to vertical social mobility is limited. Among the impediments of such mobility are the special relation between economic institutions and private universities and the trust they place in their education, the existence of specializations that have narrow career options, and the scarcity of financial aid and other forms of students support. This mobility is also hindered by the weak academic mobility between different types of secondary education and different types of higher education.

- 12. Education that contributes to the social inclusion of dropouts and individuals marginalized inside the school as well as to the prevention of social marginalization.
- 24. The phenomenon of marginalization is an aspect of all schools, though in varying degrees. All students of different ages, socioeconomic backgrounds, religious affiliations, and in all geographical locations are exposed to this phenomenon. Marginalization is manifested as aggressive or discriminatory practices against some students, and it could be manifested explicitly or implicitly. These marginalization practices could result from various causes whose nature might be educational (related to students' achievement), socio-educational, physical, or psychological, and they might come from either fellow students or from the teachers themselves. As a result, the marginalized students will be vulnerable to failing, dropping out, or being delayed in their studies; they might also suffer relative disaffection and detachment from school social life. However, the size of this phenomenon, its mechanisms, and the way to interact and deal with it cannot be determined properly because of the lack of authoritative studies on it⁶⁵.
- 25. There are sporadic efforts made by nongovernmental organizations and ministries to offer opportunities for dropouts to reintegrate in the regular educational track, or to offer them some form of vocational training to help them acquire skills needed for a certain vocation. However, the curricula aren't organized in a way that would pre-empt the phenomena of dropout and social marginalization. The curricula are organized on the basis of fixed subject matter areas that don't offer choices that would address students' preferences and interests. Moreover, the curricula don't include career guidance programs; nor do they include having clubs and workshops that value non-theoretical activities. Finally, these curricula don't provide opportunities for field work to highlight the status of the socially marginalized students, don't include any procedures that allow for making projections about the possibilities of delinquency, and don't provide students-at-risk with moral reasoning skills that could help prevent delinquency.
- 3/12/1 ➤ Schools do not have adequate human resources or special programs for reducing marginalization inside the school. Furthermore, curricula are not organized in such a way that would provide students-at-risk with the knowledge, skills, and values that would protect them from dropping out from school, social marginalization, or involvement in violent activities, or delinquency.

Part IV: Education that Contributes to Economic Development

13. Education that contributes to the development of human capital.

- 1. The educational repertoire of the Lebanese people has remarkably increased during the past decades. The illiteracy rate decreased from 32% in the early seventies to 8% in the year 2006, and the percentage of people with secondary level education and beyond increased from 8% to 27.2%. The percentage of people with secondary level education and beyond has increased as well among the economically active from 10.6% to 36.1% in 2004 while the percentage of illiterate and semi-illiterate has decreased from 64.7% to 9.1%. In the same period the illiteracy rate among younger ages (10-14 years old) has decreased to 0.5% due to the continuous increase in the rate of school enrollment⁶⁶.
- 2. An improvement of educational repertoire has taken place for the whole Lebanese society; however, there are still discrepancies among geographical locations and social classes. Discrepancies in the level of secondary education and beyond between sexes have decreased; indeed, there is a change in favor of females (13.7% for males versus 15.8% for females). But the illiteracy rate of females remained twice as much as that of males, probably due to the old inherited difference among sexes which is still witnessed clearly in older generations. It is worth noting that the percentage of male university graduates is equal to that of females in the total population; however, the percentage of university graduates among female workers is more than twice as much as the percentage of male university graduates among male workers (38% versus 16%). This is probably because females more than males seem to seek jobs that require a university degree. The discrepancies among geographical locations still exist; thus, illiteracy rate and the percentage of degree holders are still much higher in Beirut than they are in the Bekaa and the North. The discrepancies among social classes are extremely high, and yet still going higher. The percentage of families that suffer from low level of education increased from 23% in 1996 to 37.9% in 2004⁶⁷.
- 4/13/1 ➤ The educational profile of the Lebanese people has in general witnessed continuous improvement for both sexes. But the educational repertoire suffers some shortcomings in: 1) the presence of illiterates though in small percentages, especially among economically active people. In addition, the percentage of those who have secondary education and beyond still needs to be increased; 2) continued discrepancy between the center (Beirut) and the periphery; and 3) the increasing percentage of Lebanon families with low degree of saturation in education.
- 3. The economic investment of the people's human capital is still limited, and that is evident in many ways. First, vocational and technical degree holders are less than general Baccalaureate or university degree holders. Second, the average of gross

economic participation (which is the percentage of working force to the total number of population) decreased from 34% in 1997 to 31% in 2004. Third, the economic involvement of women, who surpass men at the level of secondary education and above, is still low; it only increased from 9.5% women in 1970 to 12% 2004. Economic involvement of Lebanese women is less than it is in most countries around the world even though Lebanese women maintain a higher educational level than women in these other countries. Fourth, the number of Lebanese who are leaving the country has increased during the period 1996-2001 as compared to the 1975-1990 period⁶⁸. It is worth noting that the general educational level of those leaving, as measured by literacy levels or by the Baccalaureate or the university degrees they hold, is higher than those who stay in Lebanon. Fifth, the unemployment rate increased from 8.5% in1997 to 11.5% in 2001, including holders of higher education degrees⁶⁹.

- 4/13/2 ➤ The economic investment of the population's educational repertoire is below what is expected as evidenced by: 1) the larger numbers of general education degrees compared to vocational degrees; 2) the low economic involvement, in general, and the involvement of educated women, in particular; 3) the high percentage of educated people who immigrate to other countries; and 4) the high rate of unemployment among the educated.
- 14. Education that provides competent work force to meet the needs of the Lebanese market and that can compete in free job markets.

A. Education that provides for the Lebanese job market.

- 4. The job market for university graduates suffers from a serious crisis which is represented by a plethora of graduates in the job market. The crisis is evidenced by: 1) the increasing percentage of unemployment among graduates; 2) the increasing rates of immigration; and 3) the spread of below-level employment which includes masked unemployment; and employment in jobs that require qualifications lower than those of the graduates. On the other hand, the available data do not show a shortage in the numbers of graduates as evidenced by high salaries being paid for certain specializations, hiring of highly educated foreign workers, or the existence of requests by employment institutions for graduates with qualifications not offered by higher education institutions.
- 5. Among the factors that account for excess and increased unemployment are the following:
 - a. Local market saturation: This saturation, however, hides two problems. The first problem is evidenced by the inability of the Lebanese economy to create new work opportunities. The second problem is evidenced by the laxity of professional standards in many of the production sectors. If we take the teaching profession as an example, we notice that the saturation of the local market reflects the deterioration of the professional standards and relates to lowering of wages and hiring people on non-professional and on personal grounds. But when professional standard levels are raised, there will

be a shortage in teachers as in the case within translators, social workers, and the expansion of the Higher Education Sector.

- b. In the past three decades, Lebanon has witnessed an outburst in the number of higher education institutions and their branches which were haphazardly established without any guidelines, rational planning, or governmental supervision. This situation created two problems. The first problem is that students (especially females) are attending universities for social, rather than academic and career, considerations; the degree isn't looked at by them as a vital tool for improving their chances of economic participation and competitiveness; and they are looking for easy specializations that lead to joining professions that are easy to get (such as teaching). As a result, there is dominance of Humanities specializations in universities. The second problem is that current policies allow the establishment of new universities, specializations, and branches which have been motivated sometimes by political and commercial considerations at the expense of standards, educational quality, and professional preparation (curricula, faculty qualifications, research, buildings, facilities, and student services)⁷⁰.
- c. Weak coordination among concerned parties. Thus there is no concrete coordination between the vocational and technical education and higher education and between these and those concerned with economic and employment policies, and with ministries concerned with industrial, agricultural, and service sectors. It is difficult for the implementation of an educational strategy to make a difference in meeting labor market needs if this strategy is not coupled with economic, employment, and development of human resources strategies.
- 6. Higher education in Lebanon witnessed changes in programs and in services offered for students through the creation of new programs related to new professions, the construction of corridors between academic education and professional training, and the establishment of new services to be offered to students. However, these changes appeared in a disproportionate way and were offered unequally by universities. Except for few cases such as double teaching in vocational and technical education and practical training in some university majors (such as medicine), the partnership and cooperation between educational and work institutions. In addition, services such as guidance and counseling, support and compensation programs, information services and alumni affairs services also remain weak. The educational institutions do not have databases that include information about supply and demand of work force by degree, specialization, and career position.
- 7. The relation between educational institutions and employing institutions in Lebanon, except in few instances, remains weak. This fact is manifested in the absence of, or the scarcity of involvement of economic and professional institutions 1) in the management board or advisory bodies of higher educational institutions; 2) in decisions regarding the creation of new programs and new specializations, the development and revision of curricula; 3) in college life, except for a limited role represented by filling faculty vacancies; 4) in funding research conducted by higher education institutions, proposing joint research, and requesting some studies to be carried out; and 5) in organizing individual and collective meetings and exhibitions for acquaintance purposes or for following developments here and there, and offering work and training opportunities needed by both parties.
 - 8. The bulk of flow to the labor market comes from general education due to school dropouts⁷¹. It is worth mentioning that the proportion of those who take fast

technical training sessions (certificates) is high. These training certificates programs that were provided by the private sector have not been sufficiently studied and assessed for their quality, and efforts for their development have been lacking. Moreover, there are no frameworks for coordinating these programs between employment and educational institutions, except for few individual initiatives.

4/14/1 ➤ The job market for university graduates suffers in both quantity and quality as indicated by unemployment, masked unemployment, and immigration on one hand and the low expectations from university graduates on the other hand. Economically, this problem is the result of 1) slow growth of the Lebanese economy and its inability to create new work opportunities and 2) the deterioration of professional standards in many of its sectors. Educationally, this problem is reflected 1) in the expansion of higher education driven by political and commercial considerations at the expense of the quality of input and of learning outcomes of graduates; 2) not availing databases in education regarding labor market demands; 3) weakness of partnership and communication frameworks between educational institutions and employment institutions, and 4) lack of frameworks and clear efforts to develop fast training certificate programs.

B. External competency and the suitability of vocational and Technical Education for job marked needs.

9. External competency depends on the suitability of learning outcomes, both in quantity and quality, for the demands of the job market. This competency is acutely low in vocational and Technical Education for the following reason; 1) deficiency in internal competency; absence of standards; weakness in the administrative, executive; and planning structures of the vocational and Technical Education system, which is coupled with lack of modern curricula, slowness in developing technical and legislative modernization and development; 2) bad distribution of opportunities for enrollment and specialization; the emphasis in vocational education on five areas of study that attract the majority of students, which does not fit with the actual needs of the job market; 3) competition from university degrees which led to a low market evaluation of degrees issued by Technical Vocational Education in general, and giving preferential value to university degrees in employment; 4) lack of procedures by the administration for follow-up on performance of graduates in the job market; 5) lack of partnership between productive sectors and vocational and Technical Education in general, lack of a system and centers of training for the job market, and lack of incentives and legislation to encourage productive sectors to adopt the partnership concept; 6) absence of or weak partnership with private Higher Institutes of vocational education which had proved successful in developing this sector in order to benefit from their experience to expedite the rate of development in the public sector, and 7) maintaining specialization no longer in demand and others that the job market is almost saturated with.

C. Providing a work force that is able to compete in globalized job markets

- 10. Globalization has led to important changes in the job market due to colossal technological changes and to the flow of goods, funds, people, and information across borders. These changes have affected professions and professional standards. This new situation has forced institutions of higher education to re-examine their structures in relation to their programs, services offered, curriculum content, and relation with the world of work.
- 11. Higher education in Lebanon has witnessed changes in the structure and content of the curricula of many universities even though the focus in general remains on the specialization aspect. The professional training aspect in employing institutions is weak in terms of organization, content and evaluation. Moreover, the general preparation aspect of programs, which helps the graduate absorb any development and work under different conditions, remains weak. This general preparation aspect includes knowledge and thinking skills; professional management; social and psychological skills; and communicative skills in Arabic and foreign languages and professional ethics.
- 12. The curricula in a number of universities and vocational and technical education institutions suffer from a weakness in providing students with competencies related to the economic and administrative aspects of labor. There is deficiency in matters related to cost, product quality and standards for environment protection and environmentally clean production. There is also a deficiency in providing students with administrative competencies particularly those that relate to establishment of small or medium service and production establishments by individuals or a group of partners.
- 13. While professional as well as educational professional standards have become international in the form of cooperation between educational, training, and labor institutions, most of educational, technical, vocational, and higher education institutions in Lebanon remain outside those networks. This may make students forfeit the opportunity to acquire new skills and competencies and consequently their ability to compete.
- 4/14/2 > Higher education and technical and vocational education in Lebanon exhibit serious problems in keeping pace with the global work market and in building a competitive workforce. These problems manifest themselves in a number of areas: 1) weakness of practical training; 2) weakness in general preparation that enables graduates to adapt to innovations; 3) lack of aspects related to production according to international standards; 4)) weakness in cooperation programs with international educational and employment in a specific specialization; 5) the absence of quality control and quality assurance frameworks based on international standards for technical and applied university specializations; and 6) not availing information and studies about supply and demand trends for graduates, on the regional and international levels.

Part V: Governance of Education

15. Developing a systematic Strategy for enhancing Sector effectiveness

A. Setting up Frameworks

- 1. In spite of all efforts to develop an educational strategy during the last two years, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education has not yet managed to provide enough reference documents that could serve as a guide for managing education and for defining policies, strategies, and plans.
- 2. The MEHE has not been able either to adopt a national educational strategy on the basis of which educational plans will be developed⁷².
- 3. Throughout the past few decades, several educational plans have been drafted but not approved. The latest plans that were developed are the following: the Plan for Educational Reform⁷³, the 5-year Plan for Reform of Vocational and Technical Education (1998-2002)⁷⁴, and the Plan for Education for All. The first plan did not go approved but was restricted to general education; its implementation was not done beyond the development of new curricula and new textbooks. The second plan has not been approved; the third plan has been in the development stage for a period of over three years, but has not made it beyond the draft form.
- 4. The Ministry has not developed enough specifications and standards to control quality in the administration or educational institutions. The monitoring systems in the Ministry are purely administrative, weak, or restricted to one educational sector while neglecting others. Furthermore, there are no monitoring systems, and databases, if available, are not used for this purpose.
- 5. The MEHE has not yet set frameworks or standards for quality assurance for education in schools and universities in both the public and the private sectors. Despite the fact that many Arab countries and many other countries around the world have developed national organizations for quality assurance (or for accreditation) for education, Lebanon has not issued until now any legal document about this issue.
- 6. The organizational framework of the MEHE does not include any reference to legislations that could govern and ensure supporting and developing cooperation among educational institutions, between these institutions and civic society, or between the institutions and the job market. The limited cooperation that exists here and there is done either in an advisory capacity or on individual basis.
- 5/15/1 ➤ The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) has not been able to draw the necessary frameworks for effectively managing education in Lebanon. Such needed frameworks include: 1) policies, strategies and plans; 2) standards and specifications; 3) appropriate systems for monitoring and supervision; 4) quality assurance frameworks; and 5) means of supporting cooperation within the education society and between this society and other social institutions.

5/15/2 ➤ The organizational structure and human resources of MEHE do not seem adequate for successfully carrying out its duty of setting up frameworks for education in Lebanon.

7. The MEHE has initiated cooperation (for example in developing the curricula) and consultative work (through some of the committees and other bodies set up by a ministerial decree)⁷⁵ with the private sector and the civil society. However these efforts remained limited due to the absence of the appropriate laws that constitute the organizational framework for partnership. The result of this is a weakening of the Ministry's effectiveness at the national level.

5/15/3 ➤ The MEHE has witnessed partnership experiences with the private sector as well civic society; however, these experiences did not turn into a clear rule-governed system for national educational decision-making.

B. Management

- 8. The basis of the current organization of MEHE goes to 1959. Since then, the most prominent modifications that took place include the establishment of (CERD) in 1971. The decree to establish a unit for educational guidance and educational districts was issued, but the needed steps for its implementation were not taken and no modification in the organizational structure took place; these new administrative units follow in their operation vague administrative instructions that fail, most of the time, to achieve the goals set for these units. On the other hand, the 1990's witnessed an attempt to split the Ministry of Education then into three ministries (vocational and technical education, culture and higher education, national education, youth, and sports). However, this organization was discontinued, and all these functions (except for culture and sports) were consolidated in one ministry.
- 9. The Ministry administers public education through there general directorates (one for general education, one for vocational and technical education and for Higher Education) and the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD). The General Directorate for Higher Education which was added later operates without any organizational decrees that clearly specify its structure and powers. Many proposals to reform the organization and management of MEHE have been put forward during the last two decades, the last of which was the project the Ministry did this year in cooperation with the Ministry of Administrative Development.
- 10. The functions of education remain scattered and do not follow one governmental administration. Some functions follow the MEHE. Others report to other authorities, such as Council for Development and Reconstruction, the Ministry of Public Works (school buildings), the Council of Ministers (Educational Inspectorate), and the Council of the South (school buildings in west Bekaa and the South) etc., and there is also other ministries which have formal and non-formal education roles (Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Social Affairs, etc).
- 11. The MEHE suffers from the inability of its structure to keep up with the developments witnessed by the education sector in Lebanon in the past decades and to contemporary trends in the field of administration. This can be inferred from many of the weaknesses indicated in the strategic issues in the "Vision Document".
- 12. The MEHE is working through the Educational Development Project (EDP) on establishing an Educational Management Information System (EMIS) which is an

- integrated information system designed to serve the management information needs of general education and vocational and technical education in an effort to automate the MEHE. This system has many components: 1) Educational Management Information System (EMIS), 2) School Information System (SIS), 3) National education Network (NEN), 4) Geographical Information System (GIS/School Mapping), and 5) Information Management Unit (IMU). The IMU has been established and equipment and software are about to be procured ⁷⁶. Through the EDP, the MEHE is working on the automation of examinations by establishing a Question Bank System (QBS) and Examination Management System (EMS) and Examination Generating System (EGS) ⁷⁷.
- 13. All management issues in general education apply to vocational and technical education. There are, however three points to be noted. First, CERD has functions which benefit primarily general education: Curricula, textbooks, teacher training, educational research, setting school buildings specifications, planning etc. The General Directorates for Vocational and Technical Education does all these functions by itself and sometimes in "cooperation" with CERD. This duality causes confusion in both sides. Second, the General Directorate for Vocational and Technical Education has initiated cooperation with the private sector which takes two forms: common projects and dual teaching. However, this experience has not been evaluated. Third, the higher technical education is run in a way similar to technical secondary education and this problem has been discussed in Part 2 of this document which deals with quality education.
 - 5/15/4 ➤ The management of education suffers from: 1) scattered functions and lack of coordination; and 2) traditional methods and lagging behind the educational developments in Lebanon and contemporary trends in educational management. The MEHE is developing management information systems so as to automate the Ministry.
 - 14. The Lebanese University (LU) falls under the trusteeship of the Minister and has academic, financial, and administrative independence. However, the law that governs its operation is almost 40 years old, having been issued in 1967. The many changes and developments which have taken place during this period rendered this law unsuitable and consequently resulted in discrepancies between the law and the actual practices and requirements of the modern university administration. It is hoped that the draft proposal completed recently approved and that it would serve as the framework for dealing with the problems of the University and for keeping up to date with recent developments in Higher Education.
 - 15. Theoretically, the authority in LU is in the hands of academicians who run it. However, the position of the chairperson of the department is weak in the administrative structure because of insufficient authorities assigned to it such as not allocating a budget or assistant staff. In 1977, the position of "branch director" was established along with the branching of LU after the war broke out. Despite the fact that the authority of the branch director is limited to assisting the dean of the faculty (Decree no.810 dated 5/1/1978), the director in practice assumed the academic authority in the branch; chairing the branch council and representing the chairpersons of departments in the unit council (in faculties that have branches).

 16. The Lebanese University gradually lost much of its academic and administrative autonomy. This situation is first the result of an archaic University law, which does not include detailed and modern conditions for appointment in the University to

ensure quality and transparency; second, the transfer of the authorities of the University Council to the Council of Ministers, particularly since 1996 and specially in the area of contracting full-time faculty members; and third, a surging tendency of politicians for making the University a field for competing for political influence and shares.

- 17. The current organization of the LU ensures faculty participation in decision—making at all levels (Branch Council, Faculty Council, and University Council). The participation of students in decision-making is non-existent since the break of the war in 1975. On the other hand, the Association of the Full-time professors has been successful in securing representation of the faculty members.
- 18. LU lacks societal partnership in managing its affairs. There are no economic, professional, or alumni representations neither at the executive nor at the advisory levels.
- 19. The LU lacks supporting administrative academic structures that provide decision –makers with appropriate files and data to minimally allow the University to function as expected from a modern university. This includes drafting of strategies, plans, curriculum supervision, graduate studies and research, student affairs, external programs, measurement and assessment, administration of human, academic, and financial resources and of campuses etc.
- 20. Except for financial affairs (salaries), the use of ICT is still very weak in the administration of the University and its colleges. Paper is still used for all transactions and data bases are non-existent even for students and faculty members. The use of computers in daily administrative matters is still very limited.
- 21. The administrative human resources in the LU lack the specialization needed for its operation and modern management of its affairs. In the past decades, hundreds of employees were appointed on a contractual discretionary basis. Sometimes tests were given to those and those who passed were offered regular appointment. There are no programs in the University to up-grade employees and those on contracts. Also there are no known efforts to change employment conditions to include appropriate specializations for the jobs⁷⁸.
- 5/15/5 ➤ The Lebanese University suffers from many problems in the administration of its affairs: 1) diminished authority of academicians; 2) the University's loss of it autonomy; 3) weak societal and professional partnerships to allow them to look into University matters; 4) lack of supporting administrative –academic structures; 5) weakness in ICT use 6) administrative human resources that lack proper modern and appropriate specializations; and, 7) non-existence of administrative units for human and material resources. On the other hand, the current organizational structure of the LU ensures collegiate participation in decision–making.
- 22. Human resources in charge of education in Lebanon lack the experience and qualifications needed for a proper and modern administration. The deficiency in human resources may explain the problems faced in curriculum development, teacher training, school supervision, school map development, and provision of support to schools in the application of the curricula and in the utilization of public teachers. The Ministry does not have today any clear standards or appropriate mechanisms that make it possible to appoint the right person in the right place, which leaves the door open for favoritism and political intervention.

- 5/15/6 ➤ The units of the Ministry of Education and Higher Learning suffer from quantitative and qualitative deficiencies in specialized human experienced resources in the Ministry's functions and scope of operation.
 - 16. Building a wise and dynamic management system for human and financial resources
- 23. Although the National Accord Document adopted administrative decentralization (and regional balanced development), the effort exerted to apply this principle in government units reached a dead end; this applies to educational administration. The establishment of educational districts in 1972 achieved little change with regard to decentralization. With the exception of the establishment of the School Fund in public schools (in cooperation with parents and municipalities) to fund some needed school matters, most of the school activities are managed by central authority decisions. This situation renders the local authorities unconcerned with developing and supporting the school, and helping it to assume a role in its community.
- 5/16/1 ➤ The management of education is centralized without active partnership with the local community. It is also exclusive in the sense that school administrations are not given (except in few cases) adequate authority to manage their schools.
- 24. Public schools are managed through instructions from the central administration. The school administration is not given the opportunity to choose its teachers or even express an opinion on the teachers that join or leave the school. Schools do not have financial plans or budgets and do not have any autonomy in their own planning or development and thus are not subject to social accountability. The centralization of management weakens the relation of the schools with the local authority and society especially in extra-curricular activities, common projects, and community service. The centralization constrains the school's administrative and educational roles and removes the principals' accountability regarding the consequences of their actions.

 25. The school administration consists of a hierarchical structure consisting of the principal, the supervisors, and the teachers. Supporting services such as documentation, educational and technological resources, student psychological and social guidance, and cycle coordinators (or directors) are lacking with the exception of secondary schools which have subject coordinators.
- 5/16/2 ➤ The MEHE has not yet proposed an educational vision in which the public school is allowed a special dynamism in its operation and development; the educational staff does not include specialization covering the educational roles needed by the school.

A. Relation with the Private Sector

- 26. The history of private education in Lebanon dates far back, to a time way before the establishment of the Lebanese state. This made private education a source of power and pride for Lebanon. The Lebanese constitution guaranteed the freedom of education. But educational institutions, pre-university and higher education, confessional and private profit and non-profit, have grown in a haphazard fashion during the last decades, especially during the last 10 years.
- 27. Education, in both public and private sectors, is, by definition, a public interest, related to national wealth; it is assumed that looking after public interest is the responsibility of the MEHE. The expression "looking after the public interest in private education" is intended to mean: 1) the existence of organizational frameworks for the operation of private education in a manner that serves public interests. This includes the rights of teachers and students and the right of students to acquire quality education that meets the set minimal specifications and standards, etc.; 2) the abiding of institutions of private education by these frameworks and controlling cases which harm public interest; and 3) the support of private efforts and initiatives that aim to improve the quality of education, to increase educational opportunities for the general population, and the support of activities that fall under national plans and educational development projects and programs.
- 28. The MEHE did not live up to its expected role of looking after the public interest in private education. Its role has been rather limited and so far has included conducting national examinations in general education, vocational and technical education, and higher technical education. It has also included keeping track of the names of students enrolled in private schools, offering financial support for public sector employees to help them send their children to private schools, and offering financial support to subsidized private schools. It is worth mentioning that the Ministry's monitoring of subsidized private schools required by law has been absent during the last few years.
- 5/16/3 ➤ There are clear shortcomings in the manner in which the MEHE is carrying out its duty of looking after public interest in private education in line with the spirit of the Lebanese constitution. These shortcomings are evident in: 1) weak organizational frameworks that govern this mentoring and its implications; 2) absence of overseeing procedures that ensure learners quality education based on a basic minimum standards of quality; 3) absence of support for the initiatives and efforts that lead to increased educational opportunities, improve the quality of education, and reinforce the role education plays in social integration and economic development; and 4) failure to call on private institutions to share in projects and educational development plans.
 - 17. Building a financial management system for quality improvement adopting the principle of "expenditure management"

29. There is a weakness in the efficiency of the MEHE in managing its human resources. This is indicated by the poor distribution of teachers, with shortage and

54

excess at the same time; transferring teachers from schools that need them; assigning teachers tasks that are not in their job description, and assigning teachers to other ministries. In general the student-teacher ratio is considered low in public education (8,4) compared to private education (12,6)⁷⁹, though this ratio in public schools varies according to geographical location becoming lower in rural areas because the Ministry is obliged to open schools for few number of students. There is no unit in the Ministry which deals with the administration of human resources. 30. The weakness in the efficiency of the MEHE in managing its human resources results in a weakness in its financial resources, represented by high cost and low revenues. Based on the 2003-200480 statistical data, the cost per student in public education stands at 1,618 million LL. This cost is much higher than that of subsidized private education (0,812 million LL) but lower than that of the non-free private education (1,680 million LL). Of the above cost, the government covers 1,3 million LL per student in public schools, 0.3 million LL in private schools (in the form of scholarships to employees and the expenses of the MEHE unit on private education). In both cases, the remainder is shouldered by the parents⁸¹. It looks like the cost of public education is not significantly different from that of non-free private education, but practically the cost of public education is considered rather high if we take into account the inequality in opportunities, success, educational continuation and quality of education, all of which tend to favor the private sector. There is no unit in the Ministry which deals with the administration of financial

31. The efficiency of the MEHE exhibits a weakness in managing its material resources. This is indicated by the poor use of school buildings of which some are under-utilized and others which are crowded and heavily used. It is also apparent in the complexity of operations and measures to maintain and fix school buildings. There is no unit in the Ministry which deals with the administration of material resources.

resources and economic analysis of education.

5/17/1/A ➤ The MEHE administration of public education suffers from weaknesses in administering its financial, material and human resources. The current structure does not provide modern systems or frameworks for economic analysis, rationalizing expenditure, and managing financial resources.

5/17/1/B ➤ The Public sector in Lebanon suffers from the multiplicity of sources of expenditure and from the difficulty in measuring the relation between educational income and revenues.

Notes

2

- وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005-2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص 34، ص 156.
- ³ وزارة التربية والتعليم العالمي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005-2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالمي، ص 33.
- ⁴ The study for the living conditions of families (2004) revealed that the net enrollment rate is 92.7% only at the elementary level. Yet the gross enrollment rate for students aged 5-9 and 10-14 (regardless of grade) is 98.6% and 95.2% respectively. This supports the high saturation hypothesis at that age (إدارة الإحصاء المركزي، الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر، 2006).
 - و إدارة الإحصاء المركزي (2006). الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر.
- ⁶وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005-2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص 158، وص 195. هذه النسبة تتعلق بالتعليم العام فقط. ولكن أعداد المسجلين في التعليم التقني في هذه المرحلة صغير جداً مما لا يؤثر على النتيجة (189 ألف في التعليم العام و 6 آلاف في التعليم التقني).
 - ⁷ المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام 2004-2005. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
 - ⁸ المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة الوطنية والشباب والرياضة (2000). **الزامية التعليم في لبنان: الحاجة إلى التعليم** الرسمي.
 - و المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة الوطنية والشباب والرياضة (2000). **الزامية التعليم في لبنان: الحاجة إلى التعليم** الرسمي، ص 64؛ وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005–2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالى، ص ص 181–182، ص 197.
 - المركز النربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام 2004-2005. بيروت: المركز النربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- ¹¹وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005-2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ص 52–57.
- ¹² وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005-2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ص 181–182، ص 197.
 - ¹³ المركز النربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة النربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام 2004–2005. بيروت: المركز النربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- ¹ وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (2005-2015). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ص 181-184، ص ص 196-198.
 - ¹⁵ المركز التربوي للبحوث والانماء ووزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام 2004-2005. بيروت المركز التربوي لبحوث والإنماء.
- ¹⁶ Kasparian, Choghig (2003). L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques. Université Saint-Joseph.
- ¹⁷ This rate was calculated on the basis of statistical estimates in the appendices of The Education for All Plan and on the basis of the Educational Statistics Bulletin (2004-2005).

- ¹⁸ Kasparian, Choghig (2003). L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques. Université Saint-Joseph.
- ¹⁹ The percentage of registered students in the second year Sciences in public education is 42.5% compared to 57.5% in private education. The percentage of students in the humanities in the public sector is 67.3% compared to 32.7% in the private sector

(المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، النشرة الإحصائية للعام الدراسي 2004-2005.(

⁰² المصري، عصام: "مكننة الامتحانات الرسمية"، المجلة التربوية، عدد 32، ص ص 47-49.

Kasparian, Choghig (2003). L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La ²¹
population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques. Université Saint-Joseph

²²سليم، مريم (2002). "المنهج الرسمي لرياض الأطفال في لبنان"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص 213.

²³ Each time, the curriculum mentions the Arabic language it mentions in parallel the foreign language. We read in the linguistic goals that the child should learn the mother tongue skillfully for expression and communication, the nationality of that tongue is however not mentioned...whether it is Arabic, French, Armenian, Kurdish, English or German. In the theoretical guide, it is mentioned that the mother tongue is the language which children speak at home with their parents and states in parentheses that it is "neither formal Arabic nor a foreign language", see:

حطيط، فادية (1999). "نظرة في منهج رياض الأطفال"، في: المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان: نظرة تقويمية. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ص 108-109.

²⁴سليم، مريم (2002). "المنهج الرسمي لرياض الأطفال في لبنان"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

²⁵ مقلد، سمر (2002). "التقييم و العلاقة مع الأهل في مرحلة الروضة"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوبة، ص 321.

⁶ومن هذه الأعمال مشروع تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان: نظرة تقويمية والذي نفذته الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية بين 2001و 2003. أنظر أيضاً: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (2003). التوصيات الصادرة عن هيئة متابعة خطة تقييم وتطوير الهيكلية والمناهج التعليمية. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.

²⁷ This project in a previous stage (1993-1998) had another orientation, whereby it meant by comprehensive education, "global education" geared at all classes in basic education.

⁸² سنو، عبد الرؤوف (إشراف) (2003). تقويم تجربة التربية الشمولية في لبنان. بيروت: كلية التربية-الجامعة اللبنانية.

²⁹ اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2003). المكون الثاني: تقييم مناهج المواد. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

⁰⁰ اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2002). المكون الخامس: تقييم نظام التقييم. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

¹³ هل يتراجع مستوى التعليم في لبنان، ص 6. المكون السادس: تقييم تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

³² اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2002). المكون الخامس: تقييم نظام التقييم. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

- 33 اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2003). المكون الثالث: تقييم الكتب المدرسية. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في البنان. بير وت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
 - ⁴⁴ المركز التربوي للبحوث و الإنماء، مكتب الإعداد و التدريب.
- 35 وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي (2004). مشروع التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي، ص 130.
- ³⁶ اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2002). **المكون السابع: تقييم برامج تدريب المعلمين**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- ³⁷ Comité Technique pour la Formation Continue (2001). **Projet pour la mise En Place d'un dispositif permanent de formation continue des enseignants**. Lebanon: CRDP.

أنظر أيضاً:

Gibler, Jean-Marc et Hoyek, Samir (2000). Formation continue des enseignants (sous composante 2.2), Document de projet.

- 38 أنظر خطط العمل المناطقية للاعوام 2004-2005، 2005-2006، مكتب الإعداد والترديب، المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- 3º وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي (2004). مشروع التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي، ص 63.
 - 40 در اسة رابطة أساتذة التعليم الثانوي في لبنان عام 2001.

⁴¹ Ayoubi, Z. & Boujaoude, S. (2006). **Chemistry teachers' practices in public and private schools in Beirut**. Paper presented at the Conference on Preparing Teachers for the Third Millennium, Al-Isra Private University, Amman, Jordan, May 18 and 19;

Henningsen, M.A. & Zebian, S. (2003). **High-level thinking, reasoning, and communication in Lebanese elementary mathematics classrooms**: A preliminary technical report on the 2002-2003 classroom observations of the MARAL project.

⁴² TIMSS (2003). User Guide.

⁴³ الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2001). المكون السادس: تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

Studies had been conducted in the 1990's on educational achievement and reached the same results. أنظر: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي (2000). التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان للعام 2015. لبنان: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، ص 27.

- 44 البنك الدولي (2006). "هل يتراجع مستوى التعليم في لبنان؟"، نشرة البنك الدولي-الفصل الأول.
- ⁴⁵ الأمين، عدنان (إشراف) (1997). التعليم العالي في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- ⁶⁶ الأمين، عدنان (تحرير) (2005). ضمان الجودة في التعليم العالي. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- ⁴⁷ الجامعة اللبنانية (2004). التقييم الذاتي في الجامعة اللبنانية-الجزء الأول: التقرير التوليفي. بيروت: منشورات الجامعة اللبنانية.
- 8 ر ابطة الأساتذة المتفرغين. تزخر مجلة أوراق جامعية بالمقالات والتقارير المقدمة من الهيئة التنفيذية لر ابطة الأساتذة المتفرغين في الجامعة اللبنانية، المكتب الإقليمي في الجامعة اللبنانية المكتب الإقليمي المعتمد في بيروت، والاتحاد العالمي لنقابات المعلمين (6 شباط 1998). مؤتمر دور الجامعة في مجتمع متنوع حالة لبنان،

بيروت.

- ⁹ الأمين، عدنان وآخرون (1999). قضايا الجامعة اللبنانية وإصلاحها. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية. أنظر أيضاً: دندشلي، مصطفى (محرر) (د.ت.). الجامعة اللبنانية واقعها ومستقبليها، وقائع ورشة العمل التي نظمتها ندوة العمل الوطني صباح السبت الواقع في 7 حزيران 1997، بيروت: منشورات ندوة العمل الوطني.
- www.escwa.org.lb/reports/docs/Lebanon_2005.
- ⁵¹ Moral reasoning is the logic used by the individual to address moral issues. Kolbert was the first to measure it by way of presenting a number of hypothetical moral dilemmas and concluded that moral reasoning involved three stages and two steps in every stage. This is considering that moving from stage to stage and step to step occurs through learning.
 - ²² اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2003). المكون الثاني: تقييم مناهج المواد. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2001). المكون السادس: تقييم تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
 - ⁵³ اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2003). المكون الثاني: تقييم مناهج المواد. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
 - ⁵⁴ بيضون، أحمد (1989). الصراع على تاريخ لبنان أو الهوية والزمن في أعمال مؤرخينا المعاصرين. بيروت: منشورات الجامعة اللبنانية.
 - 55 اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2002). المكون الثالث: تقييم الكتب المدرسية. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- ⁵⁶ These are dependent on local and international religious authorities and on the countries in which civil marriage is conducted.
 - ⁵⁷ اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2002). المكون الثالث: تقييم الكتب المدرسية. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في البنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
 - 8 بدر، ميشال (2005). مفاهيم حقوق الإنسان (والطفل) في مناهج التعليم العام في لبنان (دراسة توثيقية)، المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (تقرير غير منشور).
 - ⁵⁹ الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (1998). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
 - 60 الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (1998). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
 - 6 سوزان عبد الرضا (منسقة) (1998). التعليم العالي وسوق العمل في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- ⁶³ الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (1998). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية. Majzoub, Hana (1999). The Socioeconomic Background of AUB Students and their Career Decisions. Diplôme d'Etudes Supérieures en Education. Beirut.
 - 64 سوزان عبد الرضا (منسقة) (1998). التعليم العالي وسوق العمل في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- ⁶⁵ An exception is the effort of the Lebanese Association for Educational Studies in 2004, whereby it organized, for the first time in this field, a collective national conference that encompassed some 400 educational institutions. During the conference, different cases of marginalization within the school were presented, as was the effectiveness of some of the educational and psychological measures taken to deal with these cases. Also presented were initiatives and inquiries on the methods of handling or preventing such cases.
 - أنظر: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (2004). الأولاد المهمشون داخل المدرسة في لبنان. بيروت، تقرير غير منشور.

⁶⁶ The figures occurring under this title and dating back to 1970 are cited from:

The figures dating back to 1997 are cited from:

إدارة الإحصاء المركزي (1998). الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر في عام 1997.

The figures dating back to 2001 are cited from:

Kasparian, Choghig (2003). L'entrée des Jeunes Libanais dans la Vie Active et L'émigration. Université Saint Joseph.

The figures dating back to 2004 are cited from:

إدارة الإحصاء المركزي، الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر، 2006.

67 وزارة الشؤون الاجتماعية وبرنامج الأمم المتحدة الإنمائي (1998). خارطة أحوال المعيشة في لبنان، بيروت.

⁶⁸ Kasparian, Choghig (2003). L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques. Université Saint Joseph.

The study of living conditions estimates the unemployment rate at 7.9% and also demonstrates that unemployment among university graduates is less than unemployment among holders of intermediate school certificates. This variation in the givens may be attributed to emigration in general and emigration of youth in particular

(إدارة الإحصاء المركزي، الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر، 2006).

⁶⁹ Kasparian, Choghig (2003). L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques. Université Saint Joseph.

⁷⁰ أنظر: عيسى، نجيب (2000). التعليم العالي وسوق العمل في لبنان. أسكوا، منظمة العمل الدولية، مؤسسة الوطنية للاستخدام (غير منشورة).

⁷¹ أنظر: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي (2000). التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان للعام 2015. لبنان: المركز التربو ي للبحوث و الإنماء، ص ص 69-70.

⁷² It has designed the following strategy projects:

- المركز النربوي للبحوث والإنماء (2000). التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان 2015، بيروت.
- وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، مشروع الإنماء التربوي (2004). مشروع التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت.
 - وزارة التربية والنعليم العالي (2006). استراتيجية التربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت.
 - ⁷³ المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (1994). خطة النهوض التربوي في لبنان. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
 - ⁷⁴ وزارة التعليم المهني والتقني (1998). الخطة الخمسية لتطوير التعليم المهني والتقني (1**998–2002**) (222 صفحة).

وكانت قد وضعت قبلها خطة أخرى. أنظر: وزارة التعليم المهني والنقني (1993). خطة النهوض بالتعليم المهني والتقني خلال عقد التعسينات (88 صفحة). أنظر حول أحوال التخطيط في لبنان: العلم، ديالا (2004). تطوير هيكلية وزارة التربية الوطنية في لبنان (1950-2000). رسالة دبلوم دراسات عليا في التربية، كلية التربية.

 75 مثال: الهيئة التربوية الوطنية (قرار رقم (2202/3/2002)).

الأمين، عدنان وآخرون (1999). قضايا الجامعة اللبنانية وإصلاحها. بيروت: دار النهار والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، الفصل التاسع والفصل العاشر.

⁷⁶ Education Development Project/EDP. Newsletter, November 2006.

⁷⁷ Education Development Project/EDP. Newsletter, November 2006.

⁷⁸ See management issues in the Lebanese University:

⁷⁹ المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، النشرة الإحصائية للعام الدراسي 2004/2005. هذه النسب محتسبة على أساس عدد جميع المعلمين، المعينين في الملاك و المتعاقدين وغير هم.

⁸⁰ Ministry of Education and Higher Education/EDP (2006). **Survey Report and Analysis of Results**. Helsinki Consulting Group. Lebanon.

18 المركز النربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة الوطنية والشباب والرياضة (2000): **الزامية التعليم في لبنان: الحاجة إلى التعليم** الرسمي، ص ص 92- 94.